

### Stromeferry Options Appraisal - Comparative Assessment

Options Analysis			Glen Udalain		Strome Narrows Bridge	
			S4 Score (out of 10)	S4 weighted score	N9 Score (out of 10)	N9 weighted score
Main Criteria	Sub criteria	Weighting				
Environment	EN 1: Air Quality		10	2.08	8	1.67
	EN 2: Water Quality, Drainage and Flood Defence		8	1.67	10	2.08
	EN 3: Geology		10	2.08	10	2.08
	EN 4: Biodiversity & Habitats		8	1.67	10	2.08
	EN 5: Landscape		10	2.08	10	2.08
	EN 6: Visual Amenity		10	2.08	7	1.46
	EN 7: Agriculture and Soils		10	2.08	9	1.88
	EN 8: Cultural Heritage		10	2.08	8	1.67
<b>Environment Sub-Total:</b>		<b>17%</b>		<b>15.83</b>		<b>15.00</b>
Safety	S 1: TPO 3 - Solution reduces, or does not increase, the risk to and liability of, the railway and maintain suitable access over the life of the scheme		10	5.56	10	5.56
	S 2: Traffic and Transportation		10	5.56	8	4.44
	S 3: Weather impact		10	5.56	10	5.56
	<b>Safety Sub-Total:</b>		<b>17%</b>		<b>16.67</b>	
Economy	E 1: TPO 2 - Reduce the negative economic impact to the A890 study area by reducing the frequency and duration of road and rail closures caused by rock fall events		10	5.56	10	5.56
	E 2: Transport Economic Efficiency (TEE)		7	3.89	10	5.56
	E 3: Wider Economic Benefits		6	3.33	10	5.56
	<b>Economy Sub-Total:</b>		<b>17%</b>		<b>12.78</b>	
Integration	I 1: Integration with Local Plans and Policies, Regional and National Polices		10	16.67	10	16.67
	<b>Integration Sub-Total:</b>		<b>17%</b>		<b>16.67</b>	
Accessibility	A 1: TPO 1 - Reduce Impact on Journey times and journey reliability by reducing the frequency and duration of road and rail closures caused by rock fall events.		8	13.33	10	16.67
	<b>Accessibility Sub-Total:</b>		<b>17%</b>		<b>13.33</b>	
Other	O 1: Construction impact on road users and local community		10	16.67	8	13.33
	<b>Other Sub-Total:</b>		<b>17%</b>		<b>16.67</b>	

<b>Utility</b>	<b>1.00</b>		<b>91.94</b>		<b>93.89</b>
<b>Cost £M (Year)</b>			<b>57.00</b>		<b>87.00</b>
<b>Value Index</b>			<b>1.61</b>		<b>1.08</b>
<b>Ranking</b>			<b>1</b>		<b>2</b>

### Notes On scoring

1. The Criteria for each option was assessed by the working group and scored on a comparative basis. The Option which best met the criteria was awarded 10 points regardless of whether it had been rated as positive or negative in the STAG Option Appraisal. The remaining option was then scored against this value.
2. Each of the six main criteria were weighted equally.
3. The Utility score is a summation of the main criteria scores.
4. The Value Index is the Utility Score divided by the estimated cost of the Option, taken from the 2017 STAG Options Appraisal.
5. The schemes were then ranked by the Value Index figure.