THE HIGHLAND COUNCIL

Education, Children and Adult Services Committee – 28th August 2014

Agenda Item	23
Report	ECAS
No	40/14

Management Action Plans – Internal Audit Reports

Report by Director of Education, Culture and Sport

Summary

This report provides an overview of the following Internal Audit reports, relating either wholly or in part to the Care and Learning Service, considered by the Audit and Scrutiny Committee on the 19th June 2014 and progress with the related management actions that were agreed at that Committee:

- School meals income collection and monitoring system;
- School transport;
- Inspection of equipment in schools;
- Payments to Nursery providers;
- Records storage at the Highland Archive Centre

1. Background

- 1.1 The Audit and Scrutiny Committee met on the 19th June 2014. The agenda included the above reports which related, either wholly or in part, to the Care & Learning Service. In accordance with the Local Code on Corporate Governance these reports have to be reported to the relevant strategic committee of the Council.
- 1.2 This report provides a progress report in relation to the management actions agreed at that Committee. The Audit Summary report and related management actions relating to school meals income collection and monitoring system are contained within **Appendix 1.** The corresponding documents for school transport, inspection of equipment in schools, payments to Nursery providers and records storage at the Highland Archive Centre, Inverness are contained within **Appendices 2, 3, 4** and **5** respectively.

2. Progress with management actions

- 2.1 **School meals income collection and monitoring system –** the objectives of the review were as follows:
 - Controls are in place which ensure that all income is collected and recorded accurately;
 - The processes in place for banking income ensure that all income is banked securely without delay;
 - o The monitoring of income is completed on a regular basis and action is taken on a timely basis where any income is outstanding.

- 2.1.1 The Action Plan contained 6 recommendations, the status of which is now as follows:
 - The production of a comprehensive procedures manual which had not been previously completed due to capacity issues was finally completed in July 2014;
 - Procedures for collection and recording of income have been incorporated within the procedures manual and therefore this action has been completed;
 - There is evidence that a separation of duties has not been implemented in all schools in relation to reviewing income collected and checking catering returns.
 As a result a strongly worded reminder letter will be issued to all Head Teachers at the start of the 2014/15 academic year;
 - Staff training and workshops using the recently completed procedures manual has been delivered over the school summer holidays and will continue thereafter on an on-going basis;
 - Updated banking procedures were implemented in November 2012. These procedures have been documented in the recently completed procedures manual:
 - The management information system used by the Catering Service (Saffron) may be capable of producing a report that details reconciliation of banking lodgements. This project is in its final development stage with the supplier.
- 2.1.2 The implementation of the management actions identified in the Action Plan has now been completed. The effectiveness of these arrangements will be monitored on an on-going basis by the relevant staff within the Catering Service specialist support team and front-line staff.
- 2.2 **School transport** the objectives of the review were as follows:
 - Pupils allocated to school transport routes have been allocated correctly and in compliance with the School Transport policy;
 - Rejected transport allocations have been processed correctly and in compliance with the School Transport policy;
 - To ensure that the School Transport policy is adhered to for granting and withdrawing concessionary places.
- 2.2.1 Whilst the majority of management actions relate to the Transport Development Officer and will therefore be reported to the Community Services Committee on 21st August, there are a number of management actions which relate to the School Transport policy which currently remains the responsibility of the Care and Learning Service, namely:
 - The need to promptly inform relevant school parties when school transport changes occur following approval of a new contract (it is recommended that the policy is updated to provide this clarity);
 - The need to provide details of the points system used when allocating concessionary places where there are more concessionary pupils than places available on a bus (it is recommended that the policy is updated to provide this clarity);
 - Entitlement to travel to Gaelic Medium schools/units (it is recommended that the current school transport arrangements for Gaelic Medium pupils are reviewed and that a further report with recommendations is brought to this Committee following consultation with the appropriate stakeholders)

- 2.3 **Inspection of equipment in schools –** the objectives of the review were as follows:
 - There are appropriate contract arrangements in place for the inspection and testing of equipment and this is managed properly;
 - The Development & Infrastructure Service maintain up-to-date, accurate and complete records of all inspections and subsequent reports. Particular emphasis will be placed upon the process for the inspection of equipment in schools:
 - The appropriate action is undertaken and the relevant officers are informed following receipt of the inspection reports;
 - There are appropriate monitoring arrangements in place to ensure that all remedial actions are addressed within the relevant timescale. Emerging themes or issues are promptly identified and escalated in order that any costs can be identified and notified to Care and Learning management.
- 2.3.1 Whilst the majority of the actions relate to the Development and Infrastructure Service and they will therefore be reported to the Planning, Development and Infrastructure Committee, there is one specific action attributable jointly to the Head of Property and the Head of Resources, Care and Learning Service. The action in question is the requirement to introduce a process that will ensure that remedial actions arising from inspections are completed both timeously and also to the required standard. This action will be fully implemented by the end of September 2014.
- 2.3.2 In addition to the specific actions identified in the audit report the Care and Learning Service has reallocated existing budgets to ensure that there is sufficient funding to meet the annual cost of all inspection contracts and related remedial works. This will ensure that these contracts are adequately resourced from now onward.
- 2.4 **Payments to Nursery providers –** the objectives of this review were as follows:
 - The registration forms (form R1) completed for each child for whom Pre School funding is claimed provide all necessary information;
 - There are appropriate controls in place to ensure that the payments claimed by Nurseries are correct;
 - There are appropriate systems in place to ensure that payments are not made for more than the 5 Pre School sessions per week per child;
 - o Prompt action is taken to address any concerns regarding the operation of a particular Nursery provider, particularly where these relate to payments made.
- 2.4.1 All outstanding audit actions have been completed including on-going discussions with the SEEMIS project manager to discuss the impact of the new system (which has replaced the Phoenix e1 system) on the process for recording and monitoring the uptake of Nursery places across all providers and the opportunities to implement further process improvements.
- 2.5 **Records storage at the Highland Archive Centre –** the objectives of the review were as follows:
 - Storage of Council records is managed to ensure integrity and availability as appropriate to the type of records held;

- Access to Council records as in accordance with the business requirements of the Council:
- Records management complies with legislation, including the Public Records (Scotland) Act.
- 2.5.1 The review established an assurance that Council records were securely stored and managed at the Highland Archive Centre. The first objective was largely achieved with only three medium risk recommendations for improved control identified. One is completed with the remaining two recommendations due to be completed by end December 2014 and end April 2015 respectively. The second objective was mainly achieved with only two recommendations made which will be completed by end December 2014 and end April 2015 respectively. The third objective was fully achieved in all areas reviewed.

3. Implications

- 3.1 The range of Audit reports included within this report exemplifies the need to ensure that the Council's assets and resources are managed efficiently, effectively and securely. For this reason there is a commitment to complete outstanding management actions in a timeous and efficient manner.
- 3.2 The need to review school transport arrangements to Gaelic Medium Schools/Units will necessitate engagement with a wide range of stakeholders, including representatives from a range of external bodies whose aim is to promote and sustain the Gaelic language.

4. Recommendations

- 4.1 The Committee is asked to:
 - Note the management actions that have been taken to address the issues identified in these Internal Audit reports.
 - In relation to the School Transport policy agree that:
 - The policy is updated to provide clarity in relation to details of the points system used when allocating concessionary places where there are more concessionary pupils than places available on a bus;
 - The policy is updated to include the requirement to promptly inform relevant school parties when school transport changes occur following approval of a new contract;
 - The current school transport arrangements for Gaelic Medium pupils are reviewed and that a further report with recommendations is brought to this Committee following consultation with the appropriate stakeholders.

Designation: Director of Education, Culture and Sport

Date: 18th August 2014

Author: Ron MacKenzie, Head of Resources, Care and Learning Service

AUDIT REPORT SUMMARY

Report Title

Care and Learning Service - School Meals Income Collection and Monitoring System (Follow-up)

Report No.	Type of Audit		Issue Date
HC39/009.bf	Systems	Draft Report	27/05/14
		Final Report	10/06/14

1. Introduction

- 1.1 This audit was undertaken as part of the 2013/14 audit plan and records the findings of a recently completed follow-up audit in respect of school meals income collection and monitoring systems.
- 1.2 The original audit report was issued on 13/11/12 and had the audit opinion of "limited assurance". The report contained a total 17 recommendations which were classified as follows: 2 high, 12 medium and 3 low grade recommendations. Out of these 17 recommendations, 3 had been completed and the majority were due to be completed by 31/03/13. There was also a longer term action with regard to the production and issue of a procedure manual, and following this, a training programme was to be delivered during the period 01/04/13 31/03/14.
- 1.3 As a result of the audit opinion and the fact that a fraud had occurred where an employee had stolen a significant amount of catering income over a period of time before this had been identified, a follow-up review of this area was included in the audit plan.

2. Review Objectives

The objectives of the review were to ensure that the recommendations made in the previous "School Meals Income Collection and Monitoring Systems" internal audit report have been implemented, namely:

- 2.1 Controls are in place which ensure that all income is collected and recorded accurately.
- 2.2 The processes in place for banking of income ensure that all income is banked securely without delay.
- 2.3 The monitoring of income is completed on a regular basis and action is taken where any income is outstanding on a timely basis.

3. Main Findings

The main findings of the review, referenced to the above review objectives, are as follows:

3.1 This objective was not achieved as only 6 out of the 9 agreed actions have been completed. One action has been partially completed relating to standard procedures for collection and recording of income across all schools. These procedures are being updated and will be incorporated into the manual referred to above.

The 2 actions which have not been completed relate to:

- Production of a comprehensive manual, containing detailed processes for all activities associated with the collection and monitoring of school meals income. This action was originally due to be implemented by 31/03/13 and this date was later revised to 31/03/14.
- Staff training on income collection procedures and the roll out of refresher training following issue of the manual which was due to be completed by 31/03/14.

The 6 implemented actions relate to:

- Improving the operation of the cashless catering system with regard to staff recording unique identifiers.
- Provision of an online payment facility to cashless schools.

- Training in income collection for all kitchen staff and inclusion of this within the induction for new staff.
- The issue of a letter to Head Teachers highlighting the importance of separation of duties for financial transactions. However, there are schools where there are questions surrounding an indication of independent verification and therefore this instruction needs to be re-issued, particularly as this was a high grade recommendation.
- The refunds procedure has been documented and issued to all schools.
- More rigorous control of unpaid meals has been introduced with a revised template letter and regular reporting of this to the Head of Resources.
- 3.2 This objective was substantially achieved as 5 out of the 6 agreed actions were implemented, in that risk assessments were carried out. Balloch Primary is now included on a Council van drivers' route and Nairn Primary Schools now bank their income locally. In addition, on-line payment options for rural schools are to be explored within "Phase 2" of the cashless catering project. The cash handling and banking guidance note was updated to reflect changes to insurance cover and a reminder of correct banking processes was circulated to all schools. One low grade action has been partially completed as a reminder of correct banking processes was circulated to all schools, however due to the delay in issuing the comprehensive manual and refresher training, the correct banking procedures are yet to be issued.
- 3.3 This objective, relating to a high grade action has been partially achieved. Following a system upgrade there is an improved reconciliation process. However, it is unclear whether the system can provide the reconciliation of individual lodgements to the general ledger and this remains outstanding. The system supplier and the Finance Service are still working on this and it is unclear whether this will be feasible.

4. Conclusion

- 4.1 Follow the presentation of the original report to the Audit and Scrutiny Committee on 21st November 2012, it was later considered by the Adult and Children's Services Committee on 21st August 2013 when members were assured that only 4 actions were outstanding and that good progress was being made with regard to these.
- 4.2 Although there has been some progress towards implementing the agreed actions, this follow-up audit now shows that 5 actions are still to be fully implemented and include 1 high grade recommendation, relating to the ability to reconcile individual lodgements to the general ledger. Other outstanding actions which were previously agreed relate to the completion of the comprehensive procedure manual, including guidance on the collection and recording of income, and associated refresher training following the distribution of the manual. A further high priority action has also been identified from this review with regards to the need to reinforce the requirement for separation of duties in respect of financial transactions. As a result, there are 2 high, 3 medium and 1 low grade recommendations in this report. These are due to be completed by 08/08/14.
- 4.3 Due to the audit findings and the fact that this is an area where a number of frauds have occurred, this follow-up report has been given the opinion of Limited Assurance, the same as the original report.

5. Audit Opinion

5.1 The opinion is based upon, and limited to, the work performed in respect of the subject under review. Internal Audit cannot provide total assurance that control weaknesses or irregularities do not exist. It is the opinion that **Limited Assurance** can be given in that weaknesses in the system of controls are such as to put the system objectives at risk, and/ or the level of non-compliance puts the system objectives at risk.

Report Title

Care and Learning Service - School Meals Income Collection and Monitoring Systems (Follow-up)

Report No.

HC39/009.bf

Number

The Action Plan contains 6 recommendations as follows:

Description	Priority
Major issues that managers need to address as a matter of urgency.	High
Important issues that managers should address and will benefit the Organisation if implemented.	Medium
Minor issues that are not critical but managers should address.	Low
Total recommendations	:

					IMPLEMENTATION	ATION
REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT AGREED ACTION	RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET
3.1.1	Medium	The comprehensive procedures	The Catering Service should The final index for the Catering	The final index for the	Catering	27/06/14
		manual has not been completed by	complete and issue the	operational manual is Services	Services	
		the original agreed date of 31/03/13.	comprehensive procedure manual		Manager/	
		This was subsequently amended to	which details all school meals		Principal	
		31/03/14 but this was not achieved.	income processes. This would	cooks starting on the 3rd	Resources	
			help to ensure consistent	July and will include	Officer	
			processes are followed and assist Income Collection,	Income Collection,		
			with staff training. This manual Banking and Monitoring	Banking and Monitoring		
			should then be distributed to all	Procedures. The manual		
			schools.	will be given to cooks as		
				part of their training.		
				Full implementation will		
				take place from August		
				2014.		

Report Title

Care and Learning Service - School Meals Income Collection and Monitoring Systems (Follow-up)

Report No.

HC39/009.bf

					IMPLEMENTATION	ATION
REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT AGREED ACTION	RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET DATE
3.1.2	Medium	The procedures for the collection and recording of income have not been complete.	The Catering Service should provide guidance on how staff should record income collection manually for each child and ensure that a consistent process is operated across all Schools. This information should be included within the procedure manual referred to in section 3.1.1, and would therefore ensure that guidance is available to staff in the absence of the regular member of staff who undertakes the income collection process.	Procedures for collection and recording of income is categorised into 2 processes – manual and cashless, contained within the operational manual, as detailed within 3.1.1.	Catering Services Manager/ Principal Resources Officer	27/06/14
3.1.6	High	A letter to all Head Teachers reminding all Head Teachers of the importance of separation of duties for all financial transactions was issued to Head Teachers. However, there are schools where there are questions surrounding an indication of independent verification.	The Catering Service should ensure that: (1) A reminder is issued to all Head Teachers that an independent member of staff should review the income collected and catering return form as evidence of this check being completed. This could be achieved by school clerical staff inputting the Catering returns information onto Saffron or as a minimum an independent person should check and sign the catering return.	(1) Discussions have taken place with Head of Resources to re-issue this instruction once again.	Resources	03/07/14

Report Title

Care and Learning Service - School Meals Income Collection and Monitoring Systems (Follow-up)

Report No.

HC39/009.bf

	SET CE		БL	sus	/14		/14,		ρ		
ATION	TARGET		Training	Sessions	03/07/14	ಧ	18/08/14,	then	ongoing	rollout	
IMPLEMENTATION	RESPONSIBLE OFFICER		Catering	Services	Manager/	Principal	Resources	Officer			
	MANAGEMENT AGREED ACTION	the catering return specific to schools with cashless system have been prepared and are ready for issue. (3) It would be suggested that all these instructions are held in the new "Heads Up" reference library, to allow head teachers easy access for reference, and to enable electronic updates to be provided, with alerts.	See 3.1.1								
	RECOMMENDATION	(2) Head Teachers in cashless schools should verify the weekly Catering Returns in accordance with the guidance issued by the Cleaning, Catering and Facilities Management Section.	The Catering Service should	ensure that once there is a	comprehensive procedure manual	in place, refresher training is rolled	out to School's catering staff.				
	FINDING		It was highlighted that staff training	was ongoing, and refresher training	would be rolled out following issue of	the comprehensive manual.					
	GRADE		Medium								
	REPORT REF.	3.1.6 (con't)	3.1.7								

Report Title

Care and Learning Service - School Meals Income Collection and Monitoring Systems (Follow-up)

Report No.

HC39/009.bf

					IMPLEMENTATION	ATION
REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT AGREED ACTION	RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET
3.2.4	Low	_	The Catering Service should	The banking instruction	Catering	27/06/14
		banking procedures have been	ensure that the correct banking	has been issued and	Services	
		produced, however the	procedures are included in the	implemented in	Manager/	
		comprehensive manual is not yet	comprehensive manual and in	November 2012. The	Principal	
		complete.	refresher training	only outstanding matter	Resources	
				is the inclusion of this in	Officer	
				the manual, as detailed		
				above in 3.1.1		
3.3.1	High	The Saffron system supplier and the	The Catering Service should	Following further review	Principal	03/07/14
		Finance Service were working on the	undertake monthly reconciliations	with the supplier,	Resources	(subject
		option to record/ report meaningfully	on an individual lodgement basis	detailed reconciliation of	Officer	2
		on individual lodgements. It was not	to the general ledger. If the	banking lodgements may		confirmati
		clear whether this would be feasible.	findings from the Saffron system	be achievable. This is		on by the
			supplier and Finance Service	being addressed with the		Finance
			review on the record/ reporting of	Finance Service during		Service
			individual lodgement proves not to	w/c 9th June. If this is		and
			be feasible, the Catering Service	not feasible, and if this		supplier)
			should undertake monthly	requirement for monthly		
			reconciliations on an individual	detailed checks to be		
			school basis to the general ledger.	carried out was		
				mandatory, a request		
				would have to be made		
				for additional staffing		
				resource.		

AUDIT REPORT SUMMARY

Report Title

	Community Services - School Transport
•	

Report No.	Type of Audit		Issue Date
HH03/001	Systems	Draft Report	13/05/14
		Final Report	10/06/14

1. Introduction

- 1.1 The Highland Council, as an Education Authority, is required by law to arrange transport to and from school for pupils aged under 8 years who live 2 miles or more from their school, and for pupils aged 8 years or more who live 3 miles or more from their school. This applies only to pupils attending their catchment area school. Entitlement to free school transport may also depend on medical conditions, additional support needs or if the pupil's route to school is considered by the Council to be unsafe for children to walk along. Where there are spare seats on routes not taken by an entitled pupil, the Council must offer these as concessionary places to other pupils that travel along that route.
- 1.2 School transport bus routes were re-procured together with public transport bus routes for the first time in late 2011. This was for the 5 year period: January 2012 to December 2016. From August 2012 concessionary pupils are now required to pay for their place for the first time. The amount charged is £190 a year per pupil. Prior to this no fee was charged by the Council for these concessionary places.
- 1.3 Following the re-procurement exercise, the Director of Education, Culture and Sport agreed with the Head of Internal Audit & Risk Management that a review of this would be included in the audit plan audit for 2012/13. This review would include an examination of concerns that had recently been made by a Member regarding school transport arrangements in the Thurso area.
- 1.4 School Transport is managed by the Integrated Transport Public Transport section in Community Services and this is administered by three satellite offices in Aviemore, Fort William and Wick. All three offices were part of the review.

2. Review Objectives

The objectives of the review were to ensure that:

- 2.1 Pupils allocated to school transport routes have been allocated correctly and in compliance with the School Transport Policy.
- 2.2 Rejected transport applications have been processed correctly and in compliance with the School Transport Policy.
- 2.3 To ensure the School Transport Policy is adhered to for the granting and withdrawal of concessionary places.

3. Main Findings

The main findings of the review, referenced to the above review objectives, are as follows:

3.1 The objective was substantially achieved. Of the application forms examined relating to 89 pupils from Aviemore and 99 pupils from the Fort William satellite offices only 6 and 9 pupils respectively did not have school transport forms held on file. All of these pupils were entitled to free school transport or had their school transport paid for by the Council as they were in Foster Care. The reasons for not holding a form for these pupils were due to a number of outdated practices which will cease, or have now ceased.

The expectation from officers is that all pupils receiving school transport are now expected to complete a school transport form.

There were three issues with the school transport application process found during the review:

- The letter sent to parents informing pupils that they have been awarded an entitled free or concessionary school bus place does not include a statement requiring their parents/guardians to notify their local transport office of any changes to their home address or if they change school;
- School transport forms are not being completed for pupils in Foster Care;
- 1 entitled pupil at the Fort William Office had been wrongly awarded free school transport. The pupil was aged 14 years old was found to live within 3 miles of her school, contrary to the School Transport Policy (STP).
- 3.2 The objective was achieved. All 30 concessionary places awarded by the Wick and Fort William Offices had been processed correctly and in compliance with the STP.
- 3.3 This objective was substantially achieved.

The Member's concerns surrounding the transport of school pupils to Thurso High School has identified that there is a need to amend the STP in order to provide greater clarity (see below) and that communication of changes in the contracts to the affected parties was poor. Delays in the re-procurement process of the school bus routes in late 2011, due to complications, resulted in parents being informed in December 2011 that they would have to pay for transport for concessionary pupils' bus seats from January 2012, which was later than planned. Also, affected schools were not informed of the changes. Following complaints from parents the withdrawal of concessionary transport was postponed from January 2012 to August 2012.

Whilst audit findings show that the STP is being followed, in order to prevent similar problems from occurring in the future the STP could be improved by including:

- Details of the points system used when allocating concessionary places where there are too many concessionary pupils;
- Guidance on entitlement to travel to Gaelic Medium schools/units;
- A requirement to inform relevant parties (e.g. schools and parents/guardians) when school transport changes occur;
- The notice period that must be given to affected parties following a change of contract;
- The likely circumstances which would lead to a withdrawal of concessionary transport.

The Transport Development Officer, in consultation with the Head of Resources, Care & Learning Service, is currently revising the STP, which will then go to Committee for approval.

The review also found:

- It was unclear which officer has authority to decide on whether free school travel is to be provided in exceptional cases. The guidance should include direction in order to ensure there is consistency;
- Satellite offices do not have any guidance which states what documents should be retained and for how long.

4. Conclusion

- 4.1 The combining of procurement for school transport routes and public transport bus routes, and the subsequent introduction of charges for concessionary places has resulted in a number of changes. The lack of time available to communicate these changes to parents and guardians was a result of complications in the procurement process.
- 4.2 While contract tendering will inevitably result in changes to bus transport route place availability, it is important to communicate these changes effectively and in a reasonable amount of time before they take effect. The recommendations in this audit should ensure that the results of future procurement exercises are communicated more effectively and that the STP provides clearer information to parents and guardians regarding school transport eligibility.
- 4.3 There are 2 recommendations made as a result of this audit both of which are graded medium and are due to be completed by 28th August 2014.

5. Audit Opinion

5.1 The opinion is based upon, and limited to, the work performed in respect of the subject under review. Internal Audit cannot provide total assurance that control weaknesses or irregularities do not exist. It is the opinion that **Substantial Assurance** can be given in that while there is generally a sound system, there are minor areas of weakness which put some of the system objectives at risk, and/ or there is evidence that the level of non-compliance with some of the controls may put some of the system objectives at risk.

Report Title

Report No. HH03/001 **Community Services - School Transport**

The Action Plan contains 2 recommendations as follows:

High Medium Low Priority **Description**Major issues that managers need to address as a matter of urgency.
Important issues that managers should address and will benefit the Organisation if implemented. Minor issues that are not critical but managers should address. Total recommendations

Number

0000

						IMPLEMENTATION	ATION
REPORT REF.	GRADE		FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT AGREED ACTION	RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET
3.1	Medium	Θ	There is scope to improve the information within the STP in order to provide greater clarity to parents/	(i) The necessary amendments should be made to the STP.	Incorporate recommendations into draft revised STP.	Transport Development Officer	30/06/14
			luding: The need to inform relevant	5,	Report to Education, Children & Adult Services Committee.	Head of Support Services	28/08/14
			ᇰᇈ				
			a new contract;Entitlement to travel to Gaelic medium schools/units;				
			Details of the points system used when allocating concessionary places where there concessionary pupils than the concessionary pupils than the concessionary and the concessionary that the concessionary concessionary that the				
			bus places available.				

Report Title

Report No.	нноз/001
	ort
	y Services - School Transp
Report Title	Community Service

	F			IMPLEMENTATION	ATION
GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT AGREED ACTION	RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET DATE
	is no in order the is con		Currently these are referred to Area Education Managers if	Transport Development Officer	30/06/14
	between the different satellite offices regarding who is responsible for deciding the provision of free school transport in exceptional circumstances.	and Learning Service the issue of responsibility for decision making of free school travel in exceptional circumstances and include this either in the STP or the procedures for School	there is no precedent or prior policy. Will discuss with Local Transport Officers and include in guidance.		
	(ii) The STP does not state the notice period that must be given to affected parties following a change of contract.	<u> </u>	Discussion as recommended, following completion of current mid-term tender exercise.	Transport Development Officer/ Principal Contracts Officer	31/07/14
		For mid-term contract changes (e.g. due to poor performance or contract surrender by the contractor) the TDO should review the practicalities of these changes and determine principles when notice should be given to schools and parents/guardians, while still ensuring flexibility – particularly around noncontentious changes.	Discuss with Local Transport Operators and include in operating guidance.	Transport Development Officer	31/07/14

Report Title

нн03/001
port
School Trans
Community Services - 9

					8	IMPLEMENTATION	ATION
REPORT REF.	GRADE		FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT AGREED	RESPONSIBLE DEFICER	TARGET
		(III)	The STP does not include the length of notice that should be given to affected parties when concessionary seats are to be withdrawn in order to be provided to entitled pupils. The letter to parents/guardians of pupils granting concessionary places now includes the text that the concessionary place may be withdrawn at not less	(iii) The STP should include the statement in the concessionary place letter, that the place may be withdrawn at not less than 2 weeks' notice.	Include in revisions of STP as above.	Transport Development Officer	30/06/14
		<u> </u>		(iv) The STP and the standard concessionary place letter to parents/guardians should include the possible circumstances which would lead to a withdrawal of concessionary transport, while ctating this list is not	Include in revisions of STP as above.	Transport Development Officer	30/06/14
		3		exhaustive. (v) The TDO should contact Records Management regarding the period of document retention and make staff aware of this through team meetings, and include this in the procedures.	Action as recommended.	Transport Development Officer	30/06/14

Report Title

Community Services - School Transport

REF.

Report No.

HH03/001

Complete 30/06/14 28/08/14 TARGET DATE **IMPLEMENTATION** RESPONSIBLE Local Transport Development Development OFFICER Transport Transport Officers and then with the Care & on a route which at the MANAGEMENT AGREED Officers and case has been reviewed Local Transport Officer. The pupil was 2.7 miles from school but granting transport was assumed Loca Action as recommended. to be unsafe to walk. volume obtained, with Learning Service. oę **Transport** ACTION process Discuss Details time with A statement should be office of any changes to a A school transport form pupils in Foster Care and the TDO should discuss with the The circumstances behind this award and the pupil's entitlement to free transport requiring parents/ guardians should be completed for Care and Learning Service the funding of such places and who is responsible for should be reviewed by the satellite office and they to notify their local transport school letter school should make the necessary pupil's home address or RECOMMENDATION ransport applications. transport award the they change school. s,lidnd ಧ amendments. added :hese \equiv \equiv \equiv ಚ informing For pupils in Foster Care school 1 entitled pupil had been pupil applications the following issues were parents/guardians notify their has stated that these pupils but lived within 3 miles of the pupils that they have been awarded an entitled free school paid bus place does not include local transport office of any changes to their home address were not completed because the Council, through ECS and travel given school transport bus place or a concessionary forms Health and Social Care (HSC), funded the transport. The TDO wrongly awarded free school should have a form completed. school, contrary to the STP. sent a review of entitled or if they change school. application requirement parents/guardians FINDING letter transport The found: \equiv \equiv \equiv GRADE Medium REPORT

Report Title

Report No. HH03/001 Community Services - School Transport

					IMPLEMENTATION	ATION
REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT AGREED ACTION	RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET DATE
				Subsequent assessment		
				has confirmed this, and		
				new applicants from the		
				area are being granted	•	
				eligible status due to		
				road safety.		
				Work still required to Local Transport 14/08/14	Local Transport	14/08/14
				update eligibility status	Officer	
				of older pupils.		

APPENDIX 3

AUDIT REPORT SUMMARY

Report Title

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service - Inspection of Equipment in Schools

Report No.	Type of Audit		Issue Date
HC13/017.bf.bf	System	Draft Report	14/05/14
		Final Report	10/06/14

1. Introduction

- 1.1 This audit was undertaken as part of the annual plan for 2012/13 to examine the contractual management arrangements in respect of the Inspection and Testing of Plant, Equipment and Fixed Electrical Installations contract (PAS-INS125) (hereafter to be referred to as "the contract"). The contract commenced on 01/04/07 and was due to expire on 31/03/10. It was then extended for a further 3 years until 31/03/13.
- 1.2 The Property Management Section, Development & Infrastructure Service are the contract administrators on behalf of the interested Council Services such as Care and Learning Service. Each Service has a nominated officer to act on the Service's behalf.
- 1.3 As a result of concerns regarding the overall performance of the contractor, gym equipment, and fixed electrical installation inspections and testing were removed from the contract from 10/12/12 and 01/01/13 respectively. This took place during the course of the audit review.
- 1.4 A number of new contract arrangements were then put in place:
 - In January 2013, a new contract for the inspection and testing of the fixed electrical installations was awarded from February to June 2013, covering all out of date inspections up to the end of May 2013. Another contract was then let to cover the fixed electrical inspections from June to December 2013. Furthermore, new contracts for the inspection and testing of going out of date fixed electrical installations were introduced in February and March 2014 to cover properties within South and North areas respectively. In addition, a new contract was awarded in May 2014 to provide a 2 year cover for routine inspections.
 - The remaining testing and inspection elements, including gym equipment, were included with a contract for the period April 2013 to March 2014. An interim contract is currently in place which expires during August 2014. A replacement contract is presently out to tender.
- 1.5 The audit findings below relate to the arrangements that were in place prior to re-tendering taking place in January 2013.

2. Review Objectives

The objectives of the review were to ensure that:

- 2.1 There are appropriate contract arrangements in place for the inspection and testing of equipment and this is managed properly.
- 2.2 The Development & Infrastructure Service maintain up-to-date, accurate and complete records of all inspections and subsequent reports. Particular emphasis will be placed upon the process for the inspection of equipment in Schools.
- 2.3 The appropriate action is undertaken and the relevant officers are informed following receipt of the inspection reports
- 2.4 There are appropriate monitoring arrangements in place to ensure that all remedial actions are addressed within the relevant timescale. Emerging themes or issues are promptly identified and escalated in order that any costs can be identified and notified to Care and Learning Management

3. Main Findings

The main findings of the review, referenced to the above review objectives, are as follows:

- 3.1 This objective was not achieved as:
 - A number of the expected documents were either not in existence or have not been recently updated:
 - The policies which would support inspection and testing requirements including:
 - The "Electrical at Work" policy which has not been subject to recent review:
 - There are no policies for Lifting, Pressure Systems, Local Exhaust Ventilation (LEV) and Gym Equipment.
 - It was highlighted during this audit that there was no service contract in place for LEV equipment and the arrangements in place were only partially compliant with Control of Substances Hazardous to Health (COSHH) requirements. However, the COSHH requirements have since been addressed.
 - There was no procedural guidance issued to assist officers with their required roles and responsibilities.
 - In addition, no documents were held to support the contract extension for the period April 2011 March 2012.

There was limited contract monitoring during the period January 2010 to December 2011. This was undertaken by way of contract progression meetings which discussed contract and performance issues. However, only 2 meetings were held during these two years. In addition, the meetings held in 2012 were not minuted.

The contractor failed to provide the appropriate detail of report and instead provided a summarised form of testing results. In addition, review of a sample of fixed electrical inspection reports highlighted that the overall opinion did not always correlate with the individual defects identified, making it difficult to assess their importance and necessity for action.

It was not possible to establish whether the contract sums paid were accurate due to the absence of any formal contract variations after March 2009. In addition, the contractor failed to provide evidence that the schedule of works was completed, and there is no documentation to show how the annual price increases were calculated and applied.

The contractor was paid by an Officer within the Finance Service upon receipt of a monthly invoice, with no recourse to the Property Management Section. Services have then been recharged on the same basis as the allocation of insurance premiums rather than works undertaken. In addition, High Life Highland buildings were omitted in calculating the charges to the Care and Learning Service for 2012/13.

3.2 This objective was not achieved as the contractor failed to use the Council's unique site reference numbers; using their own instead. Despite requests for the contactor to reconcile their information to that held by the Council, this was not done.

There is no Council wide asset register of equipment to be inspected and therefore, it could not be established if all assets and equipment held was actually inspected.

There were issues with the contractor's database not presenting all relevant information and this was addressed through the provision of additional reports. Since the previous contract was terminated and a new contractor commenced, this has highlighted further concerns about the quality of the inspections previously undertaken. In particular, where a site has multiple buildings, only one received the fixed electrical inspections (FEI) and the Inspection and Testing (I&T) programme is expanding due to an increased number of items being found by the new contractor.

Access to the contractor's database, where the inspection reports were held, ceased from 31/03/13 due to termination of the contract. In order to address this, all reports were downloaded manually but there are issues with the completeness and accuracy of this data. In addition, the Care and Learning Service's records require updating to ensure that full records of inspections are held.

One school had received an FEI during the course of the contract but this was not recorded on the database and the inspection date is unknown. It could not be confirmed whether the FEIs are in accordance with the expected 5 yearly timescale due to no schedule of works being provided by the contractor. In addition, equipment had been inspected more

regularly than standards direct at one High School examined.

3.3 This objective was partially achieved as the Plant & Gym Equipment, records show that Care and Learning Officers are requesting and then reviewing the reports within 1-3 months of inspection. However, this is only since March 2012 and there were significantly delays before this date. The FEI reports were not being addressed in a timely manner with delays averaging 19 months.

In addition, the remedial works were not instructed by Care and Learning Officers who stated that this was due to an absence of appropriate contractors on the Framework Agreement. In addition, where works were instructed there was no evidence to demonstrate that this was subsequently completed.

3.4 As a result of the findings at (iii) above, this objective was not achieved.

4. Conclusion

- 4.1 This contract has historically not been appropriately administered and scrutinised, with appropriate steps taken to resolve issues. Council sites have potentially been put at risk of delayed inspection. The contractor did not align systems to match Council listings as requested and supply requested documentation in relation to the contract. There has been a lack of joint input over payments, with no reconciliation to works completed. It is unclear whether remedial works highlighted by the inspection and testing reports were being authorised and competed appropriately.
- 4.2 The Contract Administrator had attempted to address these concerns by subdividing the contract, putting new inspection and testing contractors in place and resuming control of contractor payments. A download of the database provided by the contractor, was undertaken, prior to the termination of access. It was advised that these reports will be entered onto the new property database, K2.
- 4.3 In moving forward, there should be improvements in the level of contract documentation held to provide sufficient guidance to officers, support contract changes, reconcile work undertaken and demonstrate adherence to the contract requirements. Council polices which cover inspection and testing arrangements should be subject to regular review. The contract should be regularly monitored and necessary action taken if the contractor deviates from the contract specification. Work should be undertaken to produce an accurate position of site inspection frequencies to ensure compliance to regulation and fully uncover the impact of any under-inspection by the previous contractor.
- 4.4 As a result, there are 2 high, 10 medium and 1 low grade recommendations in this report. 3 medium and the low grade action have been completed, with the majority of the remaining actions due to be completed by the end of September 2014. There is one longer term action which relates to ensuring that all council buildings have a valid Fixed Electrical Inspection and Test report available by the end of July 2016.

5. Audit Opinion

The opinion is based upon, and limited to, the work performed in respect of the subject under review. Internal Audit cannot provide total assurance that control weaknesses or irregularities do not exist. It is the opinion that **Limited Assurance** can be given in that weaknesses in the system of controls are such as to put the system objectives at risk, and/ or the level of non-compliance puts the system objectives at risk.

Report Title

Report No.

HC13/017.bf.bf

Number

10 T

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service - Inspection of Equipment in Schools

The Action Plan contains 13 recommendations as follows:

Description	Priority
Major issues that managers need to address as a matter of urgency. Important issues that managers should address and will benefit the Organisation if implemented. Minor issues that are not critical but managers should address.	High Medium Low

					IMPLEMENTATION	NTION
REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT AGREED ACTION	RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET
3.1.1	Medium	Various documentation which would	The Property Management	(1) All existing and future Property	Property Risk	29/08/14
		have been expected as part of good	Section should ensure that:	Inspection and Testing	Management	
		contract arrangements could not	(1) Appropriate polices are in	policies will be updated	Officer	•
		found, in particular:	place, up to date and	and subsequently		
		(1) A number of expected Council	reviewed regularly.	reviewed annually or in		
		policies which support Inspection		response to legislative		
		& Testing arrangements either did		or other requirements.		
		not exist or had not been updated		•		
		for several years. In particular:				
		The "Electrical at Work" policy				
		was subject to review;				
		There are no policies for				
		Lifting, Pressure Systems,				
		Local Exhaust Ventilation and				
		Gvm Equipment.				

Report Title

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service - Inspection of Equipment in Schools

Report No.

HC13/017.bf.bf

				IMPLEMENTATION	ATION
GRADE	-	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT AGREED ACTION	RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET
⊢	(2) I&T	guidance is in place to	(2) I&T guidance is in place to (2) Inspection and Testing	Property	26/09/14
officers detailing their roles and ensure	ensn	re all involved	procedures for contract	Manager	
responsibilities.	indivi	individuals are aware of their	management		
role a	role a	role and responsibilities.	arrangements will be		
			further developed to		
			ensure individuals are		
			aware of their role and		
			responsibilities. New,		
			robust management		
			arrangements will		
			ensure that this		
			recommendation is		
			achieved.		
	(3) All a	(3) All appropriate contract	contract (3) Appropriate contract	Property	Complete
held to support the contract docume	docume	documentation is held,	documentation is now	Manager	
	includi	including any changes such	held electronically in		
2011 to March 2012.	as con	as contract extensions.	individual contract files.		

Report Title

HC13/017.bf.bf Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service - Inspection of Equipment in Schools

Report No.

Complete Complete TARGET DATE **IMPLEMENTATION** RESPONSIBLE OFFICER Manager Manager Property Property AGREED monitoring for contract Nonissues progress Minutes are now in service will be dealt with in timeous being held and minutes are being taken and in relevant All future contracts will be explicit on what outputs are enforced by the responsible management contractor and this will be required from the appointed are now Contract Administrator. when identified are ξ conformance project files. **MANAGEMENT** measures meetings contracts. recorded out-puts Meeting Contract Contract manner. Contract place place. ACTION with Future contracts have agreed Any non-conformance with progress Property Management monitoring measures in place from the outset and these the contract is addressed with the contractor in a meetings are held, the Service should ensure that and Management Section should ensure that future contracts explicitly highlight what is required from the contractor in minutes are held for future terms of reporting requirements, statutory legislation and quality Section should ensure that: RECOMMENDATION appropriate records compliance Contract control requirements. prompt manner. are adhered to. Property reference. Where including The during the period January 2010 to There was limited contract monitoring and minutes of these were not always In addition, the contractor failed to provide the required report format, choosing instead to provide a less In addition, few contract progress meetings were held is particualary important as issues were identified with the contractor failing to conform with the contract requirements. detailed summary report. FINDING This December 2011. retained. GRADE Medium Š REPORT 3.1.2 3.1.3 REF.

Report Title

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service - Inspection of Equipment in Schools

Report No.

HC13/017.bf.bf

ION	TARGET	31/07/14	LT / / 0 / T														-				
IMPLEMENTATION	9	OFFICER of 3	5																		_
IMI	RESPO	Ĭ					··														
	AGREED	oc have	will be	when	re that	ators are		tions	contract		contract										
	MENT	recour	rated and	rted un	to ensu	Administra		Record all variations	cile	ents	Apply annual	price increases.									
	MANAGEMENT	Additional recourses have	heen allocated and will be	supplemented	necessary to ensure that	Contract Administrators are	able to:	Record	 Reconcile 	payments	Apply	price i									
		ment		are) 		_	ns and	\$	contract	ensure	on has		the /	le of	yments	to this	-	ncrease	set ont	
	CTTACME		•	randemen	ì 	variations	d, recond	ınual sun	submitted	the	ecked to	riate acti		supply	schedule	all pa	econciled.	risation.	l price i	pplied as	in the contract and confirmed
	DECOMMENDATION	Property	Service should	contractual arrangements	adhered, in that:	All contract variations should	be recorded, reconciled to	contract annual sums and	once s	contractor, the contract	variation checked to ensure	the appropriate action has	been taken.	Contractors	appropriate	works and all payments	should be reconciled to this	before authorisation.	Any annual price increase	should be applied as set out	the contri
		The		,	.0	•								ပ •	ab	×	s	pe 	• An	hs	2.
		It is not nossible to establish if the	rect as:	No records were held to evidence	sum after	2008/09. No Contract Variations	rds.	irks was	provided by the contractor and it	expected		No records were held to evidence	annual price	contract.							
	CINCINC	to estab	contract sums paid were correct as:	re held to	contract	Contract	ound for 2009/10 onwards.	No schedule of works	le contrac	າ if the	works were undertaken.	re held to		increases applied to the contract.							
	Z	possible	sums pair	scords we	ges to c	/09. No	1 for 2009	schedule	ded by th	ot knowr	s were un	scords we	basis of	ases appli							
		It is not	contract	No re	chan	2008	founc	• •	provi	is no	work	• No re	the	incre							
:	90400	High	:																		
	REPORT ,																				_

Report Title

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service - Inspection of Equipment in Schools

HC13/017.bf.bf

Report No.

Complete Complete Complete Complete TARGET DATE IMPLEMENTATION RESPONSIBLE OFFICER Property Manager Manager Property Manager Manager Property the Wi AGREED ģ Service payment mechanisms have been The recharging process recent and future contracts been and payments are being reviewed and payments has been realigned and will be applied to take account of actual costs include the Council's own unique property code for are being reconciled. incurred per Service. contract conditions. ō contracts have Infrastructure MoV Responsibility payment of Development administered MANAGEMENT transferred accordance each property. Contract ACTION has ₹ Property Management Recharges are on the basis Payments are reconciled and Section should ensure that future condition that contractors include Service should ensure that there are appropriate arrangements in place for the payment and recharge of contract sums, in administer contracts then they have the payment of any sums due to agreed to the contract sum of work undertaken rather Property Management contracts include the explicit corresponding responsibility for the authorisation and identifiers, as provided within the any additions/ contract in any correspondence deletions and annual uplifts. than insurance premiums. RECOMMENDATION Council Where they the contractor. and/ or reporting. Unidne including that: the fully processed by the Insurance & Risk Section with no input from Property invoices to the contractor were were unsatisfactory as it was based on insurance premiums rather than the assurance that all expected items The arrangements for the payment of Management Section to confirm the process for the the contract sum is Council's unique site identifiers and instead used their own numbering reconciled. As a result there is no have been inspected in accordance amount or completed works invoiced. It should be noted that this has The contractor failed to use the ₽ system, and the two sets ceased with termination of never with the contract requirements. these FINDING were as recharge of the nspection works. unsatisfactory In addition, information contract. Medium GRADE Medium REPORT 3.1.5 REF.

Report Title

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service - Inspection of Equipment in Schools

Report No.

HC13/017.bf.bf

					IMPLEMENTATION	ATION
REPORT				MANAGEMENT AGREED	RESPONSIBLE	TARGET
REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	ACTION	OFFICER	DATE
3.2.2	Medium	The absence of an asset register	(1) The Property Management (1) Consultation	(1) Consultation with	Property	31/03/15
		means that it cannot be established if	Section should work with	ce RPOs will	Manager	
		all assets and equipment were	Services to ensure that an	take place to ensure		
		inspected in accordance with the	accurate asset register is	that asset registers are		
		contract requirements.	produced and verified with	verified.		
			respective site Responsible			
			Premise Officers.			
			(2) Services should then ensure (2) Property Policy will Property	(2) Property Policy will	Property Risk	Risk 29/08/14
			that this information is kept	require Client Service	Management	
			up to date and can be	Managers to ensure that	Officer	
			verified to any inspection	service specific asset		
			reports.	registers are verified		
				and maintained at all		
				times.		

Report Title

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service - Inspection of Equipment in Schools

HC13/017.bf.bf

Report No.

Complete TARGET 30/09/14 DATE **IMPLEMENTATION** RESPONSIBLE OFFICER Property Manager Manager Property AGREED Contract payments to previous poor-A review of inspection Inspection and Testing contracts have been put in place to resolve any risks that may exist due to any omissions of the engage new contractors enhanced programme of being notified where site previous Inspection and performing contractor were reduced to nspection and testing. installations are now taken out of operation been undertaken and interim risks are identified and failed equipment/ mitigate the need can repaired or replaced Council Services carry out Festing contractor. has they MANAGEMENT records intil ACTION ಧ Property Management The expanding programme of inspection and testing of equipment. There is a financial risk as additional undertake a review to discover the full impact electrical inspection. There risks are posed to individuals Services should be notified of any risk highlighted from this The under-inspection of fixed is a risk that sites are not compliant with Inspection and testing regulations and expenditure may be incurred as a result of additional testing and operating within the sites. RECOMMENDATION remedial works. inspection & Section should review. previous contactor's Following the appointment of the new contactor this has highlighted further Where a site contains multiple It is expected that it will take a full 5 year inspection cycle to obtain An increased number of items buildings, only one building was requiring inspection have been FINDING performance, namely: fully inspected; issues with accurate data. identified. GRADE Medium REPORT REF.

Report Title

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service - Inspection of Equipment in Schools

HC13/017.bf.bf

Report No.

26/09/14 29/07/16 TARGET **IMPLEMENTATION** RESPONSIBLE OFFICER Manager Manager Property Property More effective Fixed Electrical Inspection and tendered and let in March 2014 in order to have sites that had gone contracts will conclude AGREED The Crimson data cannot be relied upon for the purpose **Testing** contracts were out of date re-inspected and tested. These two A further Fixed Electrical buildings will have a report available by the are available but due to Inspection and Testing Council peen Ξ× Electrical Note: Services have been notified that Crimson reports their lack of validation the reports are deemed as being ensure that all council in September 2014. and which ٠ has end of July 2016. interim valid Fixed MANAGEMENT Inspection remaining awarded contract Property actions are: described. T W0 unreliable. ACTION Management data is cleansed to provide inspection & testing reports downloaded Crimson an accurate picture of when Services are notified that a inspection periods exceeding Crimson sites were last inspected. listed on Crimson and those with standard guidelines should be prioritised for inspection. RECOMMENDATION Section should ensure that: Any sites not Property back-up (1) The $\overline{2}$ The contractor provided all inspection contract, the latest site reports were undertaken. However, the reports so there is the risk that the wrong in response to access being removed as a result of termination of the downloaded from Crimson and manually re-named. The report date nas been used to schedule when the provided are not just inspections, and inspection date is used and the It was also identified that Care and Learning Service's records were not Crimson. Also prompt action was not reports on their database (Crimson). required inspection periods are not up to date, and in agreement with always taken to address any remedial should FINDING inspection works identified. complied with. next GRADE High REPORT 3.2.4 REF.

Report Title

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service - Inspection of Equipment in Schools

Report No.

HC13/017.bf.bf

Report Title

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service - Inspection of Equipment in Schools

Report No.

HC13/017.bf.bf

ATION	TARGET DATE	Complete				26/09/14									29/08/14				•	_		Complete								
IMPLEMENTATION	RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	Property	Mailayei			Property	Manager								Property	Manager						Property	Manager							
	MANAGEMENT AGREED ACTION	(1) Instructions from Client	remedial works will be	recorded in each service	contract file.	Guidance will be	distributed to Client	Services to ensure that	they are able to operate	and interrogate the	records held in the	inspection and testing	database.		(2) A procedure for	requesting procurement	and completion of	remedial works will be	established	communicated to Client	Service Managers.		Infrastructure Service	will procure specialist	contracts on behalf of	Client Service Managers	via the Councils Quick	Quote process or	alternatively under the	full tendering procedure.
	RECOMMENDATION	(1) The Property Management	Remind the relevant	to en	appropriate information	is held to evidence any	remedial	authorised.	Ensure appropriate	guidance is distributed on	how to operate the new	contractor's inspection	and testing management	system.	(2) The procedure for requesting	remedial works should be	documented and distributed	to relevant Services. This	should include links to the	Framework Agreement or	Service contracts.	ğ	absence of specialist	contractors on the	Framework Agreement, they	should notify Development &	Infrastructure Service staff	accordingly in order that an	appropriate solution can be	identified.
	FINDING	(1) It was not possible to confirm	ed by I&T reports	authorised and completed.											(2) It was established that a number	of Care and Learning remedial	works were not addressed. The	reason provided for this was the	lack of suitable contractors on the	Framework Agreement.										
	GRADE	Medium																												
	REPORT REF.	3.3.2																												

Report Title

Report No.

HC13/017.bf.bf Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service - Inspection of Equipment in Schools

											IMPLEMENTATION	ATION
REPORT								MANAGEMENT		GREED	AGREED RESPONSIBLE TARGET	TARGET
REF.	GRADE		FINDING	SNE		RECOMMENDATION	DATION	ACTION			OFFICER	DATE
3.4.1	Medium	There i	s limited	Medium There is limited monitoring of		Property	Management	A process	of monitori	pue 6u	The Property Management A process of monitoring and Head of Support 26/09/14	26/09/14
		remedial	works un	remedial works undertaken by the		plnoys uc	Section should remind the reporting that contract Services and	reporting	that c	ontract	Services and	
		Contract	Administrat	Contract Administrator. Therefore, it		ant Services t	relevant Services to ensure that remedial works are being	remedial	works are	peing	Head of	
		was not	possible to	was not possible to establish if all		priate informa	appropriate information is held to completed to the required Property	completed	to the re	equired	Property	
		required	required works have	have been		nce that reme	evidence that remedial works are standards and timescales	standards	and time	escales		
		undertak	en. Also a	undertaken. Also as stated at 3.3.2		actioned and completed.	leted.	will be	will be developed	pue		
		above, C	are and L	above, Care and Learning remedial	_			implemented.	ed.			
		works hav	ve not been	works have not been undertaken.								

AUDIT REPORT SUMMARY

Report Title

Care & Learning- Payments to nursery providers (Follow-up)

Report No.	Type of Audit		Issue Date
HG05/011.bf	Systems	Draft Report	17/03/14
		Final Report	21/05/14

1. Introduction

- 1.1 An Internal Audit report (reference HG05/006) on the system weaknesses surrounding Nursery payments was issued on 31/07/12. The audit was prompted following an Internal Audit investigation into sums fraudulently claimed by a Nursery for the provision of preschool services. The Nursery, which was subsequently decommissioned by the Council, repaid the amount identified by the audit investigation. In addition to the fraud, the audit also identified four weaknesses concerning payments to Nursery providers. The report had an opinion of Limited Assurance, contained two high and two medium recommendations and the agreed actions in response to these were due to be completed by 28/02/13.
- 1.2 As a result of the audit opinion, a follow-up audit was included in the 2013/14 audit plan. The aim of the follow-up is to ensure that the management agreed actions arising from the original report were satisfactorily implemented.
- 1.3 There are significant changes to Nursery provision in that from August 2014 the level of pre-school funding will be increased from 475 to 600 hours across the Highland area (The Children and Young People Bill, 18 April 2013). These changes were not including in the scope of the audit, however, the findings from this audit should be considered when planning the implementation of these impending changes.

2. Review Objectives

The objectives of the review were to ensure that the management agreed actions had been satisfactorily implemented which will ensure that:

- 2.1 The registration forms (form R1) completed for each child for whom pre-school funding is claimed provide all necessary information.
- 2.2 There are appropriate controls in place to ensure that the payments claimed by Nurseries are correct.
- 2.3 There are appropriate systems in place to ensure that payments are not made for more than the 5 pre-school sessions per week per child.
- 2.4 Prompt action is taken to address any concerns regarding the operation of a particular Nursery provider, particularly where these relate to payments made.

3. Main Findings

The main findings of the review, referenced to the above review objectives, are as follows:

- 3.1 This objective was substantially achieved as the agreed recommendation to update the R1 forms was implemented. However, there was a delay with the use of the new R1 forms and rather than introduce these from the end of August 2012, these were not introduced until February 2013.
- 3.2 This objective was fully achieved. Both agreed actions for the Service to contact a sample of parents/ guardians to confirm attendance and funding levels, and to update the ticklist forms was implemented. However, there is scope to improve the sample checks to ensure that a sufficient response is obtained and for recording any actions taken if necessary. Furthermore, whilst the majority of ticklists reviewed had been signed by an officer from the Nursery, their position at the Nursery was not stated

- 3.3 This objective was partially achieved. The agreed recommendation for both local authority and partner nurseries to use the same management information system was implemented in that Phoenix E1 is used to record attendance information. Despite using the same system, the information is stored separately and must be reconciled to prevent double funding being claimed. In reviewing this information it could not be established that the reconciliation agreed to supporting records and this was not reviewed by an appropriate officer. Furthermore, improvements could be made to the process to record the officer who undertook the reconciliation and what remedial action was undertaken.
- 3.4 This objective was fully achieved as both agreed actions have been implemented. Staff are aware of the need to highlight any suspicions to the appropriate officer. No additional monitoring has been required as no concerns have arisen since the previous audit.

4. Conclusion

- 4.1 The previous audit agreed actions have been satisfactorily implemented in that the updated documentation is in use and checks are taking place to confirm the attendance and funding levels of nurseries. Some scope for further improvement has been identified which will improve the controls, particularly given the planned increase of pre-school hours and corresponding funding. As a result, there is 1 medium and 1 low grade recommendation in this report.
- 4.2 The medium grade recommendation is due to be implemented by 30/06/14 whilst the low grade recommendation has been implemented.

5. Audit Opinion

The opinion is based upon, and limited to, the work performed in respect of the subject under review. Internal Audit cannot provide total assurance that control weaknesses or irregularities do not exist. It is the opinion that **Substantial Assurance** can be given in that while there is generally a sound system, there are minor areas of weakness which put some of the system objectives at risk, and/ or there is evidence that the level of non-compliance with some of the controls may put some of the system objectives at risk.

Report Title

Care & Learning - Payments to nursery providers (Follow-up)

HG05/011.bf

Report No.

Number

Priority High Medium Low

The Action Plan contains 2 recommendations as follows:

DescriptionMajor issues that managers need to address as a matter of urgency.
Important issues that managers should address and will benefit the Organisation if implemented. Minor issues that are not critical but managers should address.

Total recommendations

					IMPLEMENTATION	ATION
GRADE FINDING RECOMMENDATION A	RECOMMENDATION		Σě	MANAGEMENT AGREED ACTION	RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET
The Service should amend the	The Service should amend the		β	Agreed	Resource	Complete
currently does not: audit procedure to ensure that:		audit procedure to ensure that:			Manager (Early	
(1) Obtain and record a full sample of (1) A full set of responses are		(1) A full set of responses are			Years)	
parental/ guardian responses. obtained and recorded from		obtained and recorded from				
the sample. If required, the		the sample. If required, the				
sample should be increased to	sample should be increased to	sample should be increased to				
ensure that 6 responses are	ensure that 6 responses are	ensure that 6 responses are				
received.	received.	received.				
(2) Record the officer who undertook (2) Details of the officer Agreed	(2) Details of the officer	(2) Details of the officer Agr	Agr	pee	Resource	Complete
the audit and when it took place. undertaking the audit and the		undertaking the audit and the			Manager (Early	
date it took place are recorded	date it took place are recorded	date it took place are recorded			Years)	
(3) Record what action was on the audit documentation.	action was	on the audit documentation.				
undertaken to confirm the actual (3) Details of what remedial action		(3) Details of what remedial action				
ie of differences was taken following	ie of differences was taken following	taken following		Agreed	Resource	Complete
being highlighted. notification of any differences		notification of any differences			Manager (Early	
from Parents/ Guardians and	from Parents/ Guardians and	from Parents/ Guardians and			Years)	
the final outcome should be	the final outcome should be	the final outcome should be				
recorded on the audit	the	the				
documentation.	documentation.	documentation.				

Report Title

Care & Learning - Payments to nursery providers (Follow-up)

HG05/011.bf

Report No.

ALION	TARGET	DATE	Complete																30/06/14									
IMPLEMENTATION	RESPONSIBLE	OFFICER	Resource	Manager (Early	Years)														Resource	Manager (Early	Years)							
	MANAGEMENT AGREED	ACTION	Agreed																Agreed									
		RECOMMENDATION	(1) The Service should amend the	reconciliation procedure to	ensure that:	 All source documents in 	relation to reconciliations	are be held and available	for review.	 The officer who undertook 	the reconciliation is	recorded.	 Details of any remedial 	action taken and the	outcome is recorded.	 It is reviewed by an 	appropriate officer who	signs and dates it.	(2) Discussions should take place	with the Project Manager to	establish what effect the new	system will have upon the	process for the recording and	monitoring the uptake of		providers and whether an	improved reconciliation	process can be provided.
		FINDING	(1) There is scope to improve the	present reconciliation process as:	The 2 source documents did	not match to the	reconciliation provided.	No details recorded on	reconciliation as to who	undertook the task.	No details as to what follow-	up action was undertaken.	 There were no details to 	confirm the reconciliation was	reviewed by a regarding	appropriate officer.			(2) Phoenix E1 system is due to be	replaced with SEEMIS, however,	there have been no discussions of	the effect of any changes. It	should be established whether	SEEMIS will provide an improved	reconciliation process.			
		GRADE	Medium																									
	REPORT	REF.	3.3																									

AUDIT REPORT SUMMARY

Report Title

Care and Learning Service - Records Storage at Highland Archive Centre, Inverness

Report No.	Type of Audit	
HA20/017	Computer	D

Issue Date

 Draft Report
 29/05/14

 Final Report
 10/06/14

1. Introduction

- 1.1 This report records the findings of a computer audit review on the storage of Council records at the Highland Archive and Registration Centre (HARC), Inverness. The Council's records are its corporate memory and provide evidence of actions and decisions. Therefore they are a vital corporate asset for effective management and compliance with legal and regulatory obligations.
- 1.2 The site provides a central secure storage facility for the bulk of Highland Council's paper personal records. This records store provides a central secure storage facility for the bulk of Highland Council's paper personal records, separate from and next to the Highland archives storage areas.
- 1.3 High Life Highland (HLH) was contracted by the Education, Culture and Sport Service in 2011 to manage the Council's records. This Records Management function is overseen by the Council's Senior Information & Security Officer on behalf of the Head of Digital Transformation and works closely with the Council's Managing Information Project, which aims to improve information and records management procedures in target areas and enable cost savings.
- 1.4 The audit included a site visit and specifically reviewed technical and organisational security controls in place for Council paper records managed at HARC.
- 1.5 The review was undertaken as part of the annual audit plan for 2013 2014.

2. Review Objectives

The objectives of the review were to ensure that:

- 2.1 Storage of Council records is managed to ensure integrity and availability as appropriate to the type of records held
- 2.2 Access to Council records is in accordance with the business requirements of the Council
- 2.3 Records management complies with legislation, including the Public Records (Scotland) Act.

3. Main Findings

The main findings of the review, referenced to the above review objectives, are as follows:

- 3.1 The first objective was substantially achieved in the areas reviewed. Controls were found for the storage of Council records including:
 - The HARC building was purpose built for the storage of documents to the British Standard Institute's BS5454/PD5454 'Guide for the storage & exhibition and archival documents' which provides elements of secure control for Highland's records. For example, the repository block is of thermal inertial construction to maintain internal temperature
 - External security control elements include external lighting at dusk and barriers across the road to reduce vehicle access at night
 - CCTV cameras monitor key access areas
 - Internal environmental controls including smoke sensors, fire alarms, building zoned areas and safe fire escape areas are in place
 - A building management system monitors the site environment 24/7 using sensors around the building including the records storage area

- Personnel are controlled between the public access areas and restricted zones and an intruder alarm is activated when the building closes
- Visitors are asked to sign in at reception
- There are security doors to manage public and restricted access areas
- The Responsible Premises Officer manages staff access to restricted areas within the building using access control software and ID cards
- The Records Management Team works behind the public access areas and wear security ID cards to allow access to restricted areas for their work
- Access to the records store is through a locked door in the restricted area and there are no windows
- Before records arrive at the store, the Records Team are in contact with the relevant Council Service to confirm quantity and quality of records to be delivered. Any records arriving in poor condition are cleaned in a quarantine room before being moved into storage to reduce risk of records being contaminated
- The most sensitive records stored are locked in cabinets within the Records Storage Room, separate from other records in shelving areas
- Council records sent to the store are recorded in the electronic Accession Register and given a unique identifying record number
- The HLH Records Management Team work closely with Council officers, particularly the ICT Senior Information Security Officer and Managing Information Project for consistency in Records Management processes.

Three areas were identified for improvement:

- The accession register is backed up through standard procedures for electronic files, but is not available offline. In the event of power outage and/or the network being unavailable, loss of access to this key control could result in delays in the records management processes
- The records store was at full capacity when the site was visited in February 2014. A
 new 'gatekeeper' process was introduced to allow only high risk and vital records into
 the records store at HARC. The Managing Information Project reported in January 2014
 as part of the Accession Register Review that 270 metres of low risk records had been
 identified which could be stored in a lower specification and more cost effective storage
 area
- Records registered as received during the year 2013 were found in storage boxes that
 predominantly were not labelled with description detail and trigger date to review for
 continued business need or destruction. The corporate classification and labelling
 system which was introduced in October 2013 now addresses this, as the label
 template on the Information Management Toolkit includes a destruction date.

3.2 The second objective was mainly achieved with good practice identified as follows:

- Guidance on access to records is available in Council policy documents and guidance including -
 - Highland Council's Records Management Policy
 - Records Management responsibilities are defined in the Council's Information Security Policy agreed in Aug 2013
 - The Council's Data Protection Policy
 - Retention schedules for the Council's physical and electronic records, in line with the Scottish Council on Archives Records Retention Schedules (SCARRS)
 - The Council's Information Management Toolkit which defines procedures and guidance for movement of records from the Council to HLH
- Access to records is controlled through use of a limited number of named Service Requesters. Only requests from these Council Service Requesters are acted on by the Records Management Team
- The Records Management Team maintains a spreadsheet on record requests which includes who requested records, the date requested, the record reference and file reference. When a file is returned this is also noted
- Council Officers with the most sensitive personal data stored in the repository expressed much satisfaction with the level of security and control of the storage of

their records

- The Records Management Team have a 'chase-up' process for records still out on loan after three months to check if the files are still required, or if they can be returned
- If Council Services request to permanently retain a record as they require regular access, then the file is returned to the Service, with a note placed on the transfer list and details filed under permanent withdrawals

Two areas were identified for improvement:

- There is no formalised system for updating HLH Records Management of changes to Council Service Requester names. HLH normally have to approach Council Services to confirm changes and updates to names. In mitigation, because HLH deal with some Services regularly, they generally know when people arrive or move on. HLH Records Management also have Council email accounts to view any account changes and verify names, titles and locations
- A corporately agreed system for managing loaned out records within the Council was not in place. However, each Council Service has devised their own system; the Service using the records store most was reported to have devised a successful process for managing their borrowed records.

3.3 The third objective was fully achieved in the areas reviewed:

- There were clauses within the contract agreed with HLH for security and compliance to the Data Protection Act for managing personal records
- The contract also covers requirements to enable compliance with information disclosure with the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act
- Towards compliance with the Public Records (Scotland) Act, the Council and HLH are
 working on completion of a Records Management Plan (RMP) for the Council. The
 request for submission of this by the Keeper of the Records of Scotland is expected to
 be in 2015.

4. Conclusion

- 4.1 The review found overall assurance for security of Council records at HARC. The records store, adjacent to an archives store, is situated within a purpose built new building designed in line with guidance for the storage and exhibition of archival documents. This provides Council records with elements of controls shared through proximity to the Highland archives.
- 4.2 There is good progress in the development of Records Management processes between the Council and HLH, assisted by the Managing Information Project. There is also good progress towards compliance with the new Public Records Scotland Act requirements.
- 4.3 The first objective had many controls in place in areas reviewed, with three recommendations for improved control. The second objective was mostly achieved with two recommendations made. The third objective was fully achieved in all areas reviewed
- 4.4 All actions are medium grade. One recommendation has already been completed; the remaining four are due to be completed by April 2015.

5. Audit Opinion

5.1 The opinion is based upon, and limited to, the work performed in respect of the subject under review. Internal Audit cannot provide total assurance that control weaknesses or irregularities do not exist. It is the opinion that **Substantial Assurance** can be given in that whilst there is a generally a sound system, there are areas of weakness which put some of the system objectives at risk and/ or there is evidence that the level of non-compliance with some of the controls may put some of the system objectives at risk.

Report Title

Records Storage at Highland Archive Centre (HARC), Inverness

Report No.

HA20/017

The Action Plan contains 5 recommendations as follows:

Number Priority High Medium Low Major issues that managers need to address as a matter of urgency. Important issues that managers should address and will benefit the Organisation if implemented. Minor issues that are not critical but managers should address. Description

					IMPLEMENTATION	ATION
REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT AGREED ACTION	RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET DATE
3.1.2	Medium	Accession Register				
=		The Accession Register used to record and manage Council records received	For business continuity purposes it could be useful to have an off-line	contin Inderta	Senior Information and	31/12/14
		at the Records Store at HARC is an electronic Excel spreadsheet. This is	copy of the Accession Register available	In relation to the Accession Register	Security Officer	
		held in a secure network folder area,				
		managed and backed up nightly by				
		Fujitsu. There is restricted access to				
		the Register by a limited number of Records Management Officers.				
3.1.4	Medium	Storage capacity				
		The records store was already at full	The action to identify lower risk	Lower risk records have	Senior	Complete
		capacity with boxes of records		transferred to a new off-	Security Officer	
		stacked on shelving and the floor. A	relocation out of HARC into	cito ctorado facility	And Decords	
		new 'gatekeeper' process to allow	alternative storage provides an	אורב ארטו שאב ושרווורא.	Managar	
		only high risk and vital records into	immediate solution to the storage		Mariage	
		the records store at HARC has been	capacity at HARC and should be			
		approved. Another action to identify	completed.			
		lower risk corporate legacy records				
		for relocation out of HARC was				
		reported as underway.				
3.1.5	Medium	Labelling of records in store			,	
		A sample of records in the records	Records Management Team to ask		Records	30/04/15
		store for the calendar year 2013 was	Council Services for retention	Management Service Will	Manager	

Report Title

Records Storage at Highland Archive Centre (HARC), Inverness

Report No.

HA20/017

ızı
found to be predominantly not labelled other than displaying the record number. Prior to the corporate guidance in the information management or IM Toolkit being published in Oct 2013, there was no corporate classification and labelling records. There is a risk if records are not labelled with a review date that they may be stored for longer than required, taking up storage costs.
Service Designated Requesters No Council corporate process for The procedures for Information updating HLH of changes to the list of Management (IM) Lead officers to Service Designated Requesters (that include responsibility for updating is, named officers who could submit a their Service Designated request for a record) was found. Requesters for change
Recall of records out on loan The Records Management process for chasing-up' records that have been loaned out after 3 months is usually

Report Title

Records Storage at Highland Archive Centre (HARC), Inverness

Report No.

HA20/017

					IMPLEMENTATION	ATION
REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT AGREED ACTION	RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET
		satisfactory, however it was reported	managing records borrowed/ practice to formulate a Security Officer	practice to formulate a	Security Officer	
		that 11 loaned records have never	transferred back into the Council standard approach. This	standard approach. This		
		been returned.	as a matter of priority.	approach will be		
		The Council process for managing		presented to the IMGB		
		loans requested by Services is not	Tracking processes already in use	for approval.		
		corporately managed; each Service	may provide a useful model for Tracking processes to be	Tracking processes to be		
		has their own system which may	other Services to trial to manage	added to IM Toolkit once		-
		create inconsistency. One Service	loaned out records	approved.		
		using the records storage Service the				
		most was reported as having a				
		successful process for managing their				
		borrowed records.				