

THE HIGHLAND COUNCIL
AUDIT AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
20 NOVEMBER 2014

Agenda Item	5
Report No	AS/27/14

INSPECTION OF EQUIPMENT IN SCHOOLS – INTERNAL AUDIT SUMMARY UPDATE

Report by Director of Development & Infrastructure

Summary

This report provides Members with a summary of progress in relation to the Audit Report presented to the Audit and Scrutiny Committee on 24th September 2014, and updates them on progress against the agreed action plan.

1. Background

- 1.1 The Audit and Scrutiny Committee considered an updated Internal Audit Report on the Inspection of Equipment in schools at their meeting on 24 September 2014. Members subsequently requested at that Committee that a summary report be provided that would identify further actions to be put in place to ensure the continuous safety and compliance of equipment provided for school use.
- 1.2 This report provides a concluding summary in relation to the management actions agreed at that Committee and also outlines **the following steps** to be taken to support the continuous safety and compliance of school equipment, in particular:
- the implementation of **corporate equipment** inspection policy;
 - establishment and deployment of **corporate equipment** operational procedures;
 - and delivery of **Care and Learning Service** led equipment inspection training to support essential statutory compliance.
- 1.2.1 The main objectives and findings of the original Audit report are contained within **Appendix 1** and an update of the agreed management actions are set out within **Appendix 2**.

2. Inspection of School Equipment

- 2.1 The Internal Audit report focused on the inspection categories as set out below:
- **Gym Equipment** – Inspection and Repairs (Annual Inspections);
 - **Inspection of Plant and Equipment** – Lifts, Lifting Equipment, Stage Lighting, Fume Cupboards and the like – (6/12 monthly inspections);
 - **Fixed Electrical Installations** – (5 yearly Inspections).
- 2.2 It is important to note that **a corporate approach is required to achieve full and on-going compliance**. This involves participation by both Development and Infrastructure Service (D&I) in managing equipment inspection contracts (let to various contractors) and **Care & Learning Service (C&L)** to:

- induct new school staff in rigorous equipment/premises checks;
- regularly refresh inspection training to ensure a consistent approach is maintained;
- carry out regular equipment pre-use checks inc. equipment list updates and
- ensure that equipment identified with defects is not used/removed from use.

2.3 School Gym Equipment

2.3.1 The table below sets out the responsibilities for Gym Equipment.

2.3.2 C&L Service has a specific “duty of care” in relation to equipment purchase, staff training, pre-use checks and removal of faulty equipment from curricular use.

Gym Equipment: Summary of Responsibilities		
Development and Infrastructure Service	Care and Learning Service	Notes on safety
A. Administer the Annual Inspection of gym equipment contract	1. Induct/Train users and PE teachers on use of equipment and Pre-use checks	<i>Records of training are required to be maintained</i>
B. Instruct repairs to Contractor after client authorisation	2. Purchase gym equipment	<i>If new equipment is not recorded then it may not be available for inspection</i>
	3. Maintain equipment asset register	
	4. Store equipment	<i>If equipment is poorly stored or storage affects handling / condition then damage can occur</i>
	5. Use equipment	<i>Responsibility for use of equipment rests with the Head Teacher</i>
	6. Pre-use checks to be introduced	<i>Identification of equipment defects is an essential element required for risk assessment</i>
	7. Gym equipment activity risk assessment to be introduced	
	8. Authorise repairs and replacement	<i>Delays can occur in issuing authorisation for repairs. Reasons for not authorising a repair need to be recorded (i.e. a replacement may be on order)</i>
	9. Monitor effectiveness of pre-use checks, training implementation and accuracy of equipment asset register.	<i>Line / area management involvement with reports issued to senior managers.</i>

- 2.3.3 D&I Service currently manage the contractor appointed to carry out the **annual inspection** of condition of all Gym apparatus.

Condition reports are produced by the appointed contractor at the end of each inspection and the status of each piece of apparatus is recorded with one of the following descriptors:

- **Pass**
- **Pass with attention**
- **Fail ‘do not use’** (with a recommendation for repair or replacement).

The Responsible Premises Officer (RPO)/ Head Teacher is advised of the condition status at the end of each site inspection visit.

Items highlighted with **Fail defects** can range from missing end caps on badminton stands, missing basketball nets, knotted/worn climbing ropes, staples in wall bars, loose fixings on benches through to missing anti-slip pads for vaulting, torn gym mats and damaged rails on climbing frames.

- 2.3.4 This annual inspection regime has highlighted that after inspection there will be no items of failed gym equipment left in use as RPO's are specifically advised to take defective equipment out of use.

However, gym equipment that gets damaged prior to the next inspection date should be taken out of use by the person in charge of the premises or the person directly responsible for allowing the gym equipment to be used.

- 2.3.5 This inspection process is to be strengthened and the **importance of having pre-use checks in place** to monitor any deterioration / accidental damage between annual inspections is being promoted as a measure to ensure equipment is safe before use.

- 2.3.6 In addition to this, service and inspection information relating to new equipment purchased by individual schools needs to be timeously forwarded on to D&I Service to ensure that equipment asset lists for service contractors are kept up to date. Failure to do this can result in equipment not being identified as requiring an annual inspection.

- 2.3.7 To ensure a consistent Highland wide approach is adopted, C&L Service has made a commitment to:

- develop gym activity risk assessments;
- provide advice on managing and updating school equipment lists;
- review the equipment pre-use check process and
- roll revised procedures out to all schools/PE heads of department for action throughout 2015.

- 2.3.8 It is recognised that appropriate resources, support and training will be required to assist schools in implementation of the recommendations from the internal audit. As a result, to assist Head Teachers, Council Facilities Management Assistants have commenced inspections as a pilot in a number of selected primary schools as part of their wider role in property checks. Janitorial staff will also be trained in gym equipment pre-use checks and it is planned that this will also be rolled out across all C&L facilities.

2.3.9 Development work is already underway to ensure schools have appropriate guidance, materials and checklists to support them in relation to pre-use checks. There will be further engagement with school based staff to ensure that the guidance etc. developed takes account of input from those staff which would have responsibility for its use, to ensure it reflects the most effective and workable solution within available resources. Feedback from the pilot referred to above will be used to inform further development and rollout of this approach. ECAS Committee will receive an update report on progress with the gym equipment inspection approach.

2.4 Inspection of Plant and Equipment

2.4.1 All plant and equipment such as passenger lifts, lifting equipment, slings, hoists, stage lighting and the like are rigorously inspected by a contractor appointed on behalf of the Council via Development and Infrastructure Service to ensure that equipment presented by RPO's for inspection complies with the Lifting Operations and Lifting Equipment Regulations 1998 (LOLER) and the Provision and Use of Work Equipment Regulations 1998 (PUWER).

2.4.2 Council Services are kept updated on the outcome of the equipment inspections via a database accessed through a web based electronic portal.

In addition to the portal regular e-mail condition reports are also sent to service representatives for appropriate action. All defective inspected plant and equipment is immediately taken out of service and set aside for either repair or disposal. Repairs when required are instructed via Council framework contractors. This system is working well across the Highland Council area.

2.4.3 In addition to the statutory checks noted above all operators of Council equipment have a **legal duty of care** to ensure that any equipment found to be defective via their regular pre-use check is removed from service until it has been repaired or disposed of. Council Services therefore need to ensure that operators of plant and equipment are regularly trained to be able to identify where not to use a defective piece of equipment.

2.5 Fixed Electrical Installations

2.5.1 British Standard 7671 recommends that all fixed electrical installations in public buildings must be inspected and tested on a 5year cycle. The Council via D&I Service has let a comprehensive fixed Electrical Inspection and Testing contract which will ensure that all Council public buildings have a valid Fixed Electrical Inspection and Test report by July 2016.

Any high priority electrical defects (classification "C1") identified during the inspection/testing process are instructed and remediated without any delay.

Lower priority defects (C2 and C3's) are grouped together and put out in batches for competitive pricing thus ensuring best value for the Council.

2.5.2 In addition to this RPO's/Head Teachers also have a duty to regularly inspect their properties and identify any faulty/damaged electrical equipment. Where electrical equipment is found to be damaged it is reported to local Maintenance Officers who in turn arrange remedial works to be completed via framework contractors. This established process is working across the Highland Council area.

3. Progress with Technical/Contractual Actions relating to Inspection Contracts

- 3.1 All technical/contractual aspects relating to audit actions e.g.
- inspections by contractors;
 - central record keeping and
 - contract administration have now been completed or have had instructions issued to implement improvements.

Remaining actions which have longer term impact relate to the:

- development of operational procedures;
- regular training of premises staff on pre-use checking of equipment and
- monitoring arrangements to be agreed in conjunction with Council Services.

4 Audit Findings

- 4.1 The audit report contains 13no recommendations, 2no of which are categorised as high priority. The recommendations have been accepted by management and the **table below** highlights the level of progress achieved with the implementation of all the agreed actions.

In summary, of the 13no recommendations made by Internal Audit 9no are now complete and the 4no remaining actions (3.2.2, 3.2.4, 3.3.2, and 3.4.1) will be completed by the agreed dates as set out in **Appendix 2**.

4.1.1

Summary List of Agreed Actions and Status as of 28/10/2014					
Item	Report Ref	Grade	Management Agreed Action Progress	Responsible Officer	Target Date
1	3.1.1	Medium	1no Sub-action extended to 31/10/14	Property Risk Management Officer	Complete
			2no Sub-actions are Complete	Property Manager	Complete
2	3.1.2	Medium	3no Sub-actions are Complete	Property Manager	Complete
3	3.1.3	Low	1no Action is Complete	Property Manager	Complete
4	3.1.4	High	3no Sub-actions are Complete	Head of Property	Complete
5	3.1.5	Medium	3no Sub-actions are Complete	Property Manager	Complete
6	3.2.1	Medium	1no Action is Complete	Property Manager	Complete
7	3.2.2	Medium	1no Sub-action Original Target date is 31/03/2015	Property Manager	31/03/2015 In Progress
			1no Sub-action Complete	Property Risk Management Officer	Complete
8	3.2.3	Medium	2no Sub-actions are Complete	Property Manager	Complete
9	3.2.4	High	1no Sub-action extended to 21/12/14	Property Manager	On target to be complete by 21/12/14
			1no Sub-action Original Target date is 29/07/2016	Property Manager	29/07/2016 In Progress
10	3.2.5	Medium	1no Action is Complete	Property Manager	Complete
11	3.3.1	Medium	1no Action is Complete	Property Manager	Complete
12	3.3.2	Medium	1no Sub-action extended to 28/11/14	Property Manager	Extended to 28/11/14 to ensure Client Services agree new procurement/remedial works procedures.
			2no Sub-actions are Complete	Property Manager	Complete
13	3.4.1	Medium	1no Action extended to 28/11/14	Head of Support Services and Head of Property	Extended to 28/11/14 to ensure that process for remedial works is fully deployed.

- 4.2 In addition to the specific actions identified in the audit report, the **C&L Service** has reallocated existing budgets to ensure that there is sufficient funding to meet the annual cost of all inspection contracts and related remedial works. This will ensure that these contracts are adequately resourced from now onward.
- 4.2.1 **D&I Service** will continue to provide corporate support to all Council Services through the procurement and management of all Property related service contracts with pro-active pre-use checks, staff inspection training and defective equipment removal being managed locally by each respective RPO/Head teacher.
- 4.3 In summary, this report demonstrates the steps being taken to ensure:
- that the Council's assets/equipment are managed both efficiently and effectively by RPO's/Head Teachers, supported by competent, qualified engineering servicing/inspection contractors and,
 - that engineering service contracts and equipment pre-use checks including RPO training will be sufficiently resourced, refreshed and reviewed to ensure continued compliance with existing and new statutory legislation.

5. Implications

- 5.1 **Financial and Risk:** There are potential **financial and risk** implications relating to the introduction and roll out of pre-use check training across such a large organisation that have yet to be fully appreciated.
- 5.2 **Legal:** HASWA 1974 Section 3 requires employers to ensure that non-employees (e.g. pupils/students) who may be affected by work activities are not exposed to risks to their health and safety. Where young or vulnerable persons may be affected, the duty of care is greater. This includes the provision, inspection and maintenance of equipment (including gym equipment in schools).
- 5.3 **Resource/Legal:** Failure to follow health and safety legislation can lead to enforcement action by the Health and Safety Executive (HSE) which can range from the serving of an Improvement Notice to Court Proceedings. HSE intervention is now charged at a cost of £124 per hour.
- 5.4 **Legal:** Failure to ensure safety of individuals can also lead to civil action against the Council.
- 5.5 However continued regular inspection and timeous repair of equipment will maintain a safer working environment, prolong the life of school/service assets and deliver savings in the longer term.

Recommendation

Members are invited to note the findings of the updated Audit Report presented to the Audit and Scrutiny Committee on 24 September 2014 and the progress being made by both the Care and Learning Service and Development and Infrastructure Service against the agreed audit action plan.

Designation: Director of Development and Infrastructure

Date: 11 November 2014

Author: Finlay MacDonald, Property Manager
Stuart Duncan, Property Risk Management Officer

Appendices: Audit Report Summary & Action Plan

AUDIT REPORT SUMMARY**Appendix 1****Report Title**

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service - Inspection of Equipment in Schools

Report No.	Type of Audit	Issue Date	
HC13/017.bf.bf	System	Draft Report	14/05/14
		Final Report	10/06/14

1. Introduction

- 1.1 This audit was undertaken as part of the annual plan for 2012/13 to examine the contractual management arrangements in respect of the Inspection and Testing of Plant, Equipment and Fixed Electrical Installations contract (PAS-INS125) (hereafter to be referred to as "the contract"). The contract commenced on 01/04/07 and was due to expire on 31/03/10. It was then extended for a further 3 years until 31/03/13.
- 1.2 The Property Management Section, Development & Infrastructure Service are the contract administrators on behalf of the interested Council Services such as Care and Learning Service. Each Service has a nominated officer to act on the Service's behalf.
- 1.3 As a result of concerns regarding the overall performance of the contractor, gym equipment, and fixed electrical installation inspections and testing were removed from the contract from 10/12/12 and 01/01/13 respectively. This took place during the course of the audit review.
- 1.4 A number of new contract arrangements were then put in place:
- In January 2013, a new contract for the inspection and testing of the fixed electrical installations was awarded from February to June 2013, covering all out of date inspections up to the end of May 2013. Another contract was then let to cover the fixed electrical inspections from June to December 2013. Furthermore, new contracts for the inspection and testing of going out of date fixed electrical installations were introduced in February and March 2014 to cover properties within South and North areas respectively. In addition, a new contract was awarded in May 2014 to provide a 2 year cover for routine inspections.
 - The remaining testing and inspection elements, including gym equipment, were included with a contract for the period April 2013 to March 2014. An interim contract is currently in place which expires during August 2014. A replacement contract is presently out to tender.
- 1.5 The audit findings below relate to the arrangements that were in place prior to re-tendering taking place in January 2013.

2. Review Objectives

The objectives of the review were to ensure that:

- 2.1 There are appropriate contract arrangements in place for the inspection and testing of equipment and this is managed properly.
- 2.2 The Development & Infrastructure Service maintain up-to-date, accurate and complete records of all inspections and subsequent reports. Particular emphasis will be placed upon the process for the inspection of equipment in Schools.
- 2.3 The appropriate action is undertaken and the relevant officers are informed following receipt of the inspection reports
- 2.4 There are appropriate monitoring arrangements in place to ensure that all remedial actions are addressed within the relevant timescale. Emerging themes or issues are promptly identified and escalated in order that any costs can be identified and notified to Care and Learning Management

3. Main Findings

The main findings of the review, referenced to the above review objectives, are as follows:

3.1 This objective was not achieved as:

- A number of the expected documents were either not in existence or have not been recently updated:
 - The policies which would support inspection and testing requirements including:
 - The "Electrical at Work" policy which has not been subject to recent review;
 - There are no policies for Lifting, Pressure Systems, Local Exhaust Ventilation (LEV) and Gym Equipment.
- It was highlighted during this audit that there was no service contract in place for LEV equipment and the arrangements in place were only partially compliant with Control of Substances Hazardous to Health (COSHH) requirements. However, the COSHH requirements have since been addressed.
- There was no procedural guidance issued to assist officers with their required roles and responsibilities.
- In addition, no documents were held to support the contract extension for the period April 2011 - March 2012.

There was limited contract monitoring during the period January 2010 to December 2011. This was undertaken by way of contract progression meetings which discussed contract and performance issues. However, only 2 meetings were held during these two years. In addition, the meetings held in 2012 were not minuted.

The contractor failed to provide the appropriate detail of report and instead provided a summarised form of testing results. In addition, review of a sample of fixed electrical inspection reports highlighted that the overall opinion did not always correlate with the individual defects identified, making it difficult to assess their importance and necessity for action.

It was not possible to establish whether the contract sums paid were accurate due to the absence of any formal contract variations after March 2009. In addition, the contractor failed to provide evidence that the schedule of works was completed, and there is no documentation to show how the annual price increases were calculated and applied.

The contractor was paid by an Officer within the Finance Service upon receipt of a monthly invoice, with no recourse to the Property Management Section. Services have then been recharged on the same basis as the allocation of insurance premiums rather than works undertaken. In addition, High Life Highland buildings were omitted in calculating the charges to the Care and Learning Service for 2012/13.

3.2 This objective was not achieved as the contractor failed to use the Council's unique site reference numbers; using their own instead. Despite requests for the contractor to reconcile their information to that held by the Council, this was not done.

There is no Council wide asset register of equipment to be inspected and therefore, it could not be established if all assets and equipment held was actually inspected.

There were issues with the contractor's database not presenting all relevant information and this was addressed through the provision of additional reports. Since the previous contract was terminated and a new contractor commenced, this has highlighted further concerns about the quality of the inspections previously undertaken. In particular, where a site has multiple buildings, only one received the fixed electrical inspections (FEI) and the Inspection and Testing (I&T) programme is expanding due to an increased number of items being found by the new contractor.

Access to the contractor's database, where the inspection reports were held, ceased from 31/03/13 due to termination of the contract. In order to address this, all reports were downloaded manually but there are issues with the completeness and accuracy of this data. In addition, the Care and Learning Service's records require updating to ensure that full records of inspections are held.

One school had received an FEI during the course of the contract but this was not recorded on the database and the inspection date is unknown. It could not be confirmed whether the FEIs are in accordance with the expected 5 yearly timescale due to no schedule of works being provided by the contractor. In addition, equipment had been inspected more

regularly than standards direct at one High School examined.

- 3.3 This objective was partially achieved as the Plant & Gym Equipment, records show that Care and Learning Officers are requesting and then reviewing the reports within 1-3 months of inspection. However, this is only since March 2012 and there were significantly delays before this date. The FEI reports were not being addressed in a timely manner with delays averaging 19 months.

In addition, the remedial works were not instructed by Care and Learning Officers who stated that this was due to an absence of appropriate contractors on the Framework Agreement. In addition, where works were instructed there was no evidence to demonstrate that this was subsequently completed.

- 3.4 As a result of the findings at (iii) above, this objective was not achieved.

4. Conclusion

- 4.1 This contract has historically not been appropriately administered and scrutinised, with appropriate steps taken to resolve issues. Council sites have potentially been put at risk of delayed inspection. The contractor did not align systems to match Council listings as requested and supply requested documentation in relation to the contract. There has been a lack of joint input over payments, with no reconciliation to works completed. It is unclear whether remedial works highlighted by the inspection and testing reports were being authorised and completed appropriately.

- 4.2 The Contract Administrator had attempted to address these concerns by subdividing the contract, putting new inspection and testing contractors in place and resuming control of contractor payments. A download of the database provided by the contractor, was undertaken, prior to the termination of access. It was advised that these reports will be entered onto the new property database, K2.

- 4.3 In moving forward, there should be improvements in the level of contract documentation held to provide sufficient guidance to officers, support contract changes, reconcile work undertaken and demonstrate adherence to the contract requirements. Council policies which cover inspection and testing arrangements should be subject to regular review. The contract should be regularly monitored and necessary action taken if the contractor deviates from the contract specification. Work should be undertaken to produce an accurate position of site inspection frequencies to ensure compliance to regulation and fully uncover the impact of any under-inspection by the previous contractor.

- 4.4 As a result, there are 2 high, 10 medium and 1 low grade recommendations in this report. 3 medium and the low grade action have been completed, with the majority of the remaining actions due to be completed by the end of September 2014. There is one longer term action which relates to ensuring that all council buildings have a valid Fixed Electrical Inspection and Test report available by the end of July 2016.

5. Audit Opinion

- 5.1 The opinion is based upon, and limited to, the work performed in respect of the subject under review. Internal Audit cannot provide total assurance that control weaknesses or irregularities do not exist. It is the opinion that **Limited Assurance** can be given in that weaknesses in the system of controls are such as to put the system objectives at risk, and/ or the level of non-compliance puts the system objectives at risk.

AUDIT REPORT ACTION PLAN

APPENDIX 2

Report Title

Report No.

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service – Inspection of Equipment in Schools

HC13/017.bf.bf

The Action Plan contains **13** recommendations as follows:

Description

Major issues that managers need to address as a matter of urgency.
 Important issues that managers should address and will benefit the Organisation if implemented.
 Minor issues that are not critical but managers should address.

Priority	Number
High	2
Medium	10
Low	1
	13

Total recommendations

REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT ACTION	IMPLEMENTATION	
					RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET DATE
3.1.1	Medium	<p>Various documentation which would have been expected as part of good contract arrangements could not be found, in particular:</p> <p>(1) A number of expected Council policies which support Inspection & Testing arrangements either did not exist or had not been updated for several years. In particular:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The "Electrical at Work" policy was subject to review; There are no policies for Lifting, Pressure Systems, Local Exhaust Ventilation and Gym Equipment. 	<p>The Property Management Section should ensure that:</p> <p>(1) Appropriate policies are in place, up to date and reviewed regularly.</p>	<p>(1) All existing and future Inspection and Testing policies will be updated and subsequently reviewed annually or in response to legislative or other requirements.</p>	Property Risk Management Officer	Policy review and updating arrangements are now in place. Complete.

AUDIT REPORT ACTION PLAN

APPENDIX 2

Report Title

Report No.

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service – Inspection of Equipment in Schools

HC13/017.bf.bf

REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT ACTION	IMPLEMENTATION	
					RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET DATE
3.1.1 (cont'd)		(2) There is no guidance available to officers detailing their roles and responsibilities.	(2) I&T guidance is in place to ensure all involved individuals are aware of their role and responsibilities.	(2) Inspection and Testing procedures for contract management arrangements will be further developed to ensure individuals are aware of their role and responsibilities. New, robust management arrangements will ensure that this recommendation is achieved.	Property Manager	Complete
		(3) There is no formal documentation held to support the contract extension for the period April 2011 to March 2012.	(3) All appropriate contract documentation is held, including any changes such as contract extensions.	(3) Appropriate contract documentation is now held electronically in individual contract files.	Property Manager	Complete

AUDIT REPORT ACTION PLAN

APPENDIX 2

Report Title

Report No.

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service – Inspection of Equipment in Schools

HC13/017.bf.bf

REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT ACTION	IMPLEMENTATION	
					RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET DATE
3.1.2	Medium	There was limited contract monitoring during the period January 2010 to December 2011. In addition, few contract progress meetings were held and minutes of these were not always retained. This is particularly important as issues were identified with the contractor failing to conform with the contract requirements.	<p>The Property Management Section should ensure that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Future contracts have agreed monitoring measures in place from the outset and these are adhered to. • Any non-conformance with the contract is addressed with the contractor in a prompt manner. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contract monitoring measures for contract out-puts are now in place. • Contract management meetings are now in place for service contracts. Non-conformance issues when identified will be dealt with in timeous manner. • Contract progress Meeting Minutes are being held and minutes are being taken and recorded in relevant project files. 	Property Manager	Complete
3.1.3	Low	In addition, the contractor failed to provide the required report format, choosing instead to provide a less detailed summary report.	<p>The Property Management Section should ensure that future contracts explicitly highlight what is required from the contractor in terms of reporting requirements, including compliance with statutory legislation and quality control requirements.</p>	<p>All future contracts will be explicit on what outputs are required from the appointed contractor and this will be enforced by the responsible Contract Administrator.</p>	Property Manager	Complete

AUDIT REPORT ACTION PLAN

APPENDIX 2

Report Title

Report No.

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service – Inspection of Equipment in Schools

HC13/017.bf.bf

REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT ACTION	IMPLEMENTATION	
					RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET DATE
3.1.4	High	<p>It is not possible to establish if the contract sums paid were correct as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> No records were held to evidence changes to contract sum after 2008/09. No Contract Variations found for 2009/10 onwards. No schedule of works was provided by the contractor and it is not known if the expected works were undertaken. No records were held to evidence the basis of annual price increases applied to the contract. 	<p>The Property Management Service should ensure that contractual arrangements are adhered, in that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> All contract variations should be recorded, reconciled to contract annual sums and once submitted to contractor, the contract variation checked to ensure the appropriate action has been taken. Contractors supply the appropriate schedule of works and all payments should be reconciled to this before authorisation. Any annual price increase should be applied as set out in the contract and confirmed in writing. 	<p>Additional resources have been allocated and will be supplemented when necessary to ensure that Contract Administrators are able to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record all variations Reconcile contract payments Apply annual contract price increases. 	Head of Property	Complete

AUDIT REPORT ACTION PLAN

APPENDIX 2

Report Title

Report No.

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service – Inspection of Equipment in Schools

HC13/017.bf.bf

REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT ACTION	AGREED	IMPLEMENTATION	
						RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET DATE
3.1.5	Medium	<p>The arrangements for the payment of invoices to the contractor were unsatisfactory as these were processed by the Insurance & Risk Section with no input from Property Management Section to confirm amount or completed works invoiced. It should be noted that this has ceased with termination of the contract.</p> <p>In addition, the process for the recharge of the contract sum is unsatisfactory as it was based on insurance premiums rather than the inspection works.</p>	<p>The Property Management Service should ensure that there are appropriate arrangements in place for the payment and recharge of contract sums, in that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Where they administer contracts then they have the corresponding responsibility for the authorisation and payment of any sums due to the contractor. Payments are reconciled and agreed to the contract sum including any additions/deletions and annual uplifts. Recharges are on the basis of work undertaken rather than insurance premiums. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Responsibility for payment of contracts has now been transferred to the Development and Infrastructure Service and payments are being administered in accordance with contract conditions. Contract payment mechanisms have been reviewed and payments are being reconciled. The recharging process has been realigned and will be applied to take account of actual costs incurred per Service. 	Property Manager	Complete	
3.2.1	Medium	<p>The contractor failed to use the Council's unique site identifiers and instead used their own numbering system, and the two sets of information were never fully reconciled. As a result there is no assurance that all expected items have been inspected in accordance with the contract requirements.</p>	<p>The Property Management Section should ensure that future contracts include the explicit condition that contractors include the Unique Council Site identifiers, as provided within the contract in any correspondence and/ or reporting.</p>	<p>All recent and future contracts have or will include the Council's own unique property code for each property.</p>	Property Manager	Complete	

AUDIT REPORT ACTION PLAN

APPENDIX 2

Report Title

Report No.

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service – Inspection of Equipment in Schools

HC13/017.bf.bf

REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT ACTION	AGREED ACTION	IMPLEMENTATION	
						RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET DATE
3.2.2	Medium	The absence of an asset register means that it cannot be established if all assets and equipment were inspected in accordance with the contract requirements.	<p>(1) The Property Management Section should work with Services to ensure that an accurate asset register is produced and verified with respective site Responsible Premise Officers.</p> <p>(2) Services should then ensure that this information is kept up to date and can be verified to any inspection reports.</p>	<p>(1) Consultation with Council service RPOs will take place to ensure that asset registers are verified.</p> <p>(2) Property Policy will require Client Service Managers to ensure that service specific asset registers are verified and maintained at all times.</p>	<p>Property Manager</p> <p>Property Risk Management Officer</p>	<p>31/03/15 In Progress</p> <p>Property now Complete. Service Consultation process in progress as per 3.2.2(1) above.</p>	

AUDIT REPORT ACTION PLAN

APPENDIX 2

Report Title

Report No.

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service – Inspection of Equipment in Schools

HC13/017.bf.bf

REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT ACTION	IMPLEMENTATION	
					RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET DATE
3.2.3	Medium	<p>Following the appointment of the new contactor this has highlighted further issues with previous contactor's performance, namely:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Where a site contains multiple buildings, only one building was fully inspected; An increased number of items requiring inspection have been identified. <p>It is expected that it will take a full 5 year inspection cycle to obtain accurate data.</p>	<p>The Property Management Section should undertake a review to discover the full impact of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The under-inspection of fixed electrical inspection. There is a risk that sites are not compliant with inspection and testing regulations and risks are posed to individuals operating within the sites. The expanding programme of inspection and testing of equipment. There is a financial risk as additional expenditure may be incurred as a result of additional inspection & testing and remedial works. <p>Services should be notified of any risk highlighted from this review.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A review of inspection records has been undertaken and interim Inspection and Testing contracts have been put in place to resolve any risks that may exist due to any omissions of the previous Inspection and Testing contractor. Contract payments to the previous performing contractor were reduced to mitigate the need to engage new contractors to carry out an enhanced programme of inspection and testing. Council Services are being notified where site risks are identified and any failed equipment/installations are now taken out of operation until they can be repaired or replaced. 	Property Manager	Complete
				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contract payments to the previous performing contractor were reduced to mitigate the need to engage new contractors to carry out an enhanced programme of inspection and testing. Council Services are being notified where site risks are identified and any failed equipment/installations are now taken out of operation until they can be repaired or replaced. 	Property Manager	Complete

AUDIT REPORT ACTION PLAN

APPENDIX 2

Report Title

Report No.

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service – Inspection of Equipment in Schools

HC13/017.bf.bf

REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT ACTION	AGREED ACTION	IMPLEMENTATION	
						RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET DATE
3.2.4	High	The contractor provided all inspection reports on their database (Crimson). In response to access being removed as a result of termination of the contract, the latest site reports were downloaded from Crimson and manually re-named. The report date has been used to schedule when the next inspection should be undertaken. However, the reports provided are not just inspections, and so there is the risk that the wrong inspection date is used and the required inspection periods are not complied with. It was also identified that Care and Learning Service's records were not up to date, and in agreement with Crimson. Also prompt action was not always taken to address any remedial works identified.	<p>The Property Management Section should ensure that:</p> <p>(1) The downloaded Crimson data is cleansed to provide an accurate picture of when sites were last inspected. Any sites not listed on Crimson and those with inspection periods exceeding standard guidelines should be prioritised for inspection.</p> <p>(2) Services are notified that a back-up of Crimson inspection & testing reports is held.</p>	<p>The Crimson data cannot be relied upon for the purpose described. More effective actions are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Two interim Fixed Electrical Inspection and Testing contracts were tendered and let in March 2014 in order to have sites that had gone out of date re-inspected and tested. The South contract has concluded and the North contract will complete in December 14. A further Fixed Electrical Inspection and Testing contract for all remaining Council Property has been awarded which will ensure that all council buildings will have a valid Fixed Electrical Inspection and Test report available by the end of July 2016. <p>Note: Services have been notified that Crimson reports are available but due to their lack of validation the reports are deemed as being unreliable.</p>	Property Manager	On target to be complete by 21/12/14	
						Property Manager	29/07/16 In Progress

AUDIT REPORT ACTION PLAN

APPENDIX 2

Report Title

Report No.

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service – Inspection of Equipment in Schools

HC13/017.bf.bf

REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT ACTION	IMPLEMENTATION	
					RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET DATE
3.2.5	Medium	<p>It is not possible to establish if inspections were performed within the specified timescale as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Previous inspection dates for FEI were not recorded on Grimson. • No record on Grimson of South Lodge Primary being FEI inspected. The Contract Administrator confirmed that had been undertaken but could not specify the date. • At one school plant equipment was being inspected more regularly than required. 	<p>The Property Management Section should ensure that the inspection periods are monitored to ensure that these are in accordance with the contract's schedule of works and required standards. Any variances should be promptly addressed with the contractor.</p>	<p>Regular contract progress meetings are being held with the appointed service contractors to ensure that contract programmes are adhered to and that contract specifications are being followed.</p> <p>Any deviation from contract specifications would be discussed and resolved during regular progress meetings with the service contractors.</p>	Property Manager	Complete
3.3.1	Medium	<p>It was not possible to verify that inspection reports were being reviewed and forwarded in a timely manner as this is not always evidenced. In addition, there were significant delays, averaging over 19 months, in the forwarding of some reports.</p>	<p>The Property Management Service should remind Service contract representatives that the review and forwarding of all testing and inspection reports should be undertaken in a reasonable timeframe and the appropriate records updated to evidence this.</p>	<p>Service contract reports will be circulated timely to Client Service Managers. Contract Administrators will monitor and record the circulation of inspection reports to Client Service Managers. The new Inspection and Testing contract has a web based portal which provides Council Premises Managers access to copies of all inspection certificates. In addition to this all inspection certification is now e-mailed out to Premises Managers for their review.</p>	Property Manager	Complete

AUDIT REPORT ACTION PLAN

APPENDIX 2

Report Title

Report No.

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service – Inspection of Equipment in Schools

HC13/017.bf.bf

REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT ACTION	AGREED	IMPLEMENTATION	
						RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET DATE
3.3.2	Medium	<p>(1) It was not possible to confirm whether remedial works highlighted by I&T reports were authorised and completed.</p> <p>(2) It was established that a number of Care and Learning remedial works were not addressed. The reason provided for this was the lack of suitable contractors on the Framework Agreement.</p>	<p>(1) The Property Management Section should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Remind the relevant Services to ensure that appropriate information is held to evidence any remedial works authorised. Ensure appropriate guidance is distributed on how to operate the new contractor's inspection and testing management system. <p>(2) The procedure for requesting remedial works should be documented and distributed to relevant Services. This should include links to the Framework Agreement or Service contracts.</p> <p>(3) Where Services identify the absence of specialist contractors on the Framework Agreement, they should notify Development & Infrastructure Service staff accordingly in order that an appropriate solution can be identified.</p>	<p>(1) Instructions from Client Services to proceed with remedial works will be recorded in each service contract file. Guidance will be distributed to Client Services to ensure that they are able to operate and interrogate the records held in the inspection and testing database.</p> <p>(2) A procedure for requesting procurement and completion of remedial works will be established and communicated to Client Service Managers.</p> <p>(3) Development and Infrastructure Service will procure specialist contracts on behalf of Client Service Managers via the Councils Quick Quote process or alternatively under the full tendering procedure.</p>	<p>Property Manager</p> <p>Property Manager</p> <p>Property Manager</p>	<p>Complete</p> <p>Complete</p> <p>On target to be complete by 28/11/14</p> <p>Complete</p>	

AUDIT REPORT ACTION PLAN

APPENDIX 2

Report Title

Report No.

Care & Learning Service/ Development & Infrastructure Service – Inspection of Equipment in Schools

HC13/017.bf.bf

REPORT REF.	GRADE	FINDING	RECOMMENDATION	MANAGEMENT ACTION	IMPLEMENTATION	
					RESPONSIBLE OFFICER	TARGET DATE
3.4.1	Medium	There is limited monitoring of remedial works undertaken by the Contract Administrator. Therefore, it was not possible to establish if all required works have been undertaken. Also as stated at 3.3.2 above, Care and Learning remedial works have not been undertaken.	The Property Management Section should remind the relevant Services to ensure that appropriate information is held to evidence that remedial works are actioned and completed.	A process of monitoring and reporting that contract remedial works are being completed to the required standards and timescales will be developed and implemented. Every Administrator will monitor and report on the status and action being taken in relation to all identified defects.	Head of Support Services and Head of Property	On target to be complete by 28/11/14