THE HIGHLAND COUNCIL

NORTH PLANNING APPLICATIONS COMMITTEE 28 April 2015

14/03574/FUL and 14/03576/LBC : Highland Council Drummuie Area Office, Golspie

Report by Area Planning Manager

SUMMARY

Description : Reconstruct chimney stack to orig inal height, but at 800mm thickness using original stones plus additional stonework

Recommendation - GRANT PLANNING PERMISSION AND REFER LISTED BUILDING CONSENT APPLICATION TO HISTORIC SCOTLAND

Ward: 05 - East Sutherland and Edderton

Development category : Local development

Pre-determination hearing : None

Reason referred to Committee : Community Council objection

1. PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

1.1 The building was built in 1903 as a boarding and technical school by the Countess of Sutherland. It is a large and symmetr ical with projecting wings and a U-plan, over 3 floors, with ridge and wallhead chimney stacks and a slate roof. The building is category B Listed.

The building was converted to offices by Highland Council in 2008 and is now used by the Council as a c orporate office serving the area. Following the detection of movement in a chimney stack on the east wing of the building in November 2013 during strong winds, the Counc il submitted a Planning Appl ication and L isted Building Consent to reduce its height.

1.2 Early, informal pre-application discussions were held between Highland Co uncil, the Planning Authority and Histo ric Scotland over remedial measures to the stack once the problem had been identified. Advice was provided by the Planning Authority, in consultation with Historic Scotland, into what would be acceptable with regards to the historic fabric of the building, and what in formation would be required in support of applications. The Planning Application and Listed Building Consent applications were received on 29.10.2014. Initially it had been proposed

Agenda Item	
Report No	PLN/023/15

to reduce the height of the affected ch imney stack. This however was not considered acceptable in terms of national guidance and policy and could not be supported. Following ex tensive discussions with the Conser vation Officer and Historic Scotland agreement the pr oposal has ben amended and acc eptable solution found whereby it is proposed to reconstruct the chimney stack to its original height, but at 800mm thickness us ing original stones plus additional stonework.

- 1.3 Various documents have been submitted in support of the applications for Planning Permission and Listed Building Consent:
 - Engineer inspection assessment of existing chimney (19.12.2013)
 - Photographs
 - Letter from Historic Scotland (18.02.2014)
 - Supporting letter (16.09.2014)
- 1.5 **Variations**: None

2. SITE DESCRIPTION

2.1 The building is located to the south of Golspie and to the west side of the A9(T).

3. PLANNING HISTORY

05/00315/NIDSU and 05/00316/LBCSU Refurbishment of existing grade B listed building to for m office accomm odation. Rec onfiguration of main entrance stairs for DDA compliance. Extension / upgrade of existing access road and formation of car park. Chang e of use to class 4 property. Approved by Scottish Ministers 18. 07.2006, following consideration b y Committee on 31.05.2006.

4. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

- 4.1 Advertised :
 - 14/03574/FUL 14.11.2014, expiry 28.11.2014
 - 14/03576/LBC 14.11.2014, expiry 05.12.2014

Timeous representations : 1

Late representations : 0

- 4.2 Material considerations raised are summarised as follows:
 - The chimney does not add to the vi sual appearance of the building and would not be missed
 - Lowering its height would not visually improve the building
- 4.3 All letters of representation are available for inspection via the Council's eplanning portal which can be accessed through the internet www.wam.highland.gov.uk/wam. Access to computers can be made avai lable via Planning and Development Service offices.

5. CONSULTATIONS

5.1 **Conservation Officer** : The proposed development require s to be fully justified in terms of the applicable legislation and national guidance. The applicant's Engineer has stated that it is possible to retain the chimney. The proposal as originally submitted to reduce the height of the chimney had not been proper ly justified and could not be given supported under current policy and guidance.

Following the provision of further supporting information (19.03.2015) justifying the works to the chimney, the proposal as submitted is now considered t o be acceptable.

5.2 **Historic Scotland (19.03.2015)** : They had raised concerns initially over the original proposal to reduce the height of the chimney. However following the submission of further information they accepted that it was not feasible to rebuild to its original height and accept the current proposal.

6. DEVELOPMENT PLAN POLICY

The following policies are relevant to the assessment of the application

6.1 Highland Wide Local Development Plan 2012

- 28 Sustainable Design
- 57 Natural, Built and Cultural Heritage

6.2 Sutherland Local Plan (2010)

7. OTHER MATERIAL CONSIDERATIONS

7.1 Draft Development Plan

Not applicable

7.2 Highland Council Supplementary Planning Policy Guidance Not applicable

7.3 Scottish Government Planning Policy and Guidance

Scottish Historic Environment Policy (SHEP)

8. PLANNING APPRAISAL

8.1 Section 25 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 requires planning applications to be det ermined in accordance with the development plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

Furthermore, under s59 of the Planning (Lis ted Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997, the Planning Author ity shall have spec ial regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of specia I architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

8.2 This means that the application requires to be asse ssed against all policies of the Development Plan relevant to the application, all national and local policy guidance and all other material considerations relevant to the application.

8.3 **Development Plan Policy Assessment**

The proposal has to be assessed against the Listed Building legislation, particularly with regards to the potential loss of architectural fabric and consequent impact on the historic interest of the building.

8.4 Material Considerations

The proposal is for the reduction in the height of the existing chimney stack. The original submission was lacking in supporting information, particularly a clear identification of potential options and assessment of solutions. Initially 4 options had been identified however as outlined above these had not been properly assessed and justified as required

Subsequent lengthy discussions between the applicant and the Planning Authority have resulted in the submission of addition al information which in turn has been provided to and ass essed by Historic Sc otland and the Planning Authority's Conservation Officer.

Following this, an additional document (27.02.2015) outlining 6 options was provided by the agent. This outlined x options which were (we should summarise)

Summary of Options:

1 – Lower chimney to ground

Carefully remove the cans, cope stone and stack stones, and lower to the ground. Check that the fireplaces are bricked up a nd fill the flues with lightweight mortar. Install new rafters as per the Structural Engineer's re commendations. Install new sarking, underfelt and slates over void where stack removed. Strike scaffolding.

2 – Reduce height of chimney from 6.35m to 3.75m from gutter line

Number the stack stones. Carefully re move the cans, cope stone and stack stones, lower to the gr ound and store for re-u se. Install temporary rafter bri dging timbers to support the bridle. Fill the flues wit h lean mix concrete and insert steel reinforcing bars. Install a steel angle at the corbel and rebuild the stack to a safe height, all as recommended by the Structural Engineer. Refix the cope stone and cans. Install new bridle to the rafte rs as per the Structural Engineer's recommendations. Fit new lead flashing, etc around stack. Strike scaffold. The top floor is disrupted for the reconstruction, and the lower floors are dis rupted for works to fireplaces and flues, The chim ney is of similar construction to the original but with lesser height. The ro of structure does not require to be strengthened.

3 – Rebuild chimney stack to original height

Carefully remove the cans, cope stone and stack stones, and lower to the ground. Install new bridle as per the Structural Engineer's re commendations. Install new strengthening to the existing roof struct ure as per the Structural Engineer's recommendations. Rebuild the chimney stack, cope and cans to the original height and thickness. Install collars round the stack with ties back to the roof structure as per the Structural Engineer's recommendations. Fit new lead flashing, etc around stack. Strike scaffold.

4 - Reconstruct chimney stack to original height, but at 800mm thickness using original stones plus additional stonework as necessary

Number the stack stones. Carefully re move the cans, cope stone and stack stones, lower to the ground and store for re-use.

Install temporary rafter br idging timbers to support t he bridle. Check that the fireplaces are bricked up and fill the flues with lean mix concrete. Remove flooring adjacent to stack to allow access around stack. Install additional foundation, and build extra skin of blockwork up inside fa ce of gable wall all as recommended by Structural Engineer. Reinstate floors and in ternal finishes. Reconstruct chimney stack to original height, but at 800mm thickness using original stones plus additional stonework as necess ary. Supply and inst all new cope stone to suit increased thickness of stack. Refix cans. Install new bridle to the rafters as per the Structural Engineer's recommendations. Fit new lead flashing, etc around stack. Strike scaffold.

5 - Reconstruct chimney stack to original height, but at 800mm thickness using original stones plus additional stonework as necessary; augment corbelling

Number the stack stones. Carefully re move the cans, cope stone and stack stones, lower to the ground and store for re-use. Augment the corbelling within the roof space to take extra weight. Recons truct chimney stack to original height, but at 800mm thickness using original stones plus additional stonework as necessary. Supply and install new cope stone to suit increased thickness of stack. Refix cans. Install new bridle to the rafters as per the Structural Engineer's recommendations. Fit new lead flashing, etc around stack. Strike scaffold.

6 - As Option 4

Using steel columns on the in side face of the gable wall rather than a s kin of blockwork.

All of the options wer e carefully considered by the Planning Authority and Historic Scotland. Option 1 for the complete removal of the chimney was unacceptable as the appearance of the building would be changed by its removal removing to its detriment and would conflict with national and local guidance.

Golspie Community Counc il had objected to the applic ations noting that the chimney did not add to the visual appearance of the building and would not be missed nor would lowering its height vis ually improve the build ing. However the removal or lowering of the chimney stack would impact on the visual charecter of the building and would accordin gly impact on the architecture and historic interest of the building.

Notwithstanding this, it is considered t hat the evaluation and assessment of all options which the applicant has now undertaken does clearly demonstrate that the proposal – Option 4: Reconstruct chimney st ack to original height, but at 800mm

thickness using original stones plus additional stonework as necessary. It balances the need for a practical repair solu tion with the least impact on both the external appearance and internal fabric of the building. It is therefore assessed as not having a signific ant impact on the arch itectural and historic fabric of the building; and therefore accords with Development Plan policies 28 and 57, as well as s59 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997. Both Historic Scotland and the Conser vation officer are satisfied that it has been demonstrated that the sugg ested course of action is the most appropriate in this instance having regard to relevant legislation

The Planning Authority considers that this solution (Option 4) is acceptable and accords with the Development Plan policies.

8.5 **Other Considerations – not material**

This is a c ase where the Highland Council could sav e public money – *Planning Comment* - Whilst the Planning Authority re cognises the costs involved in the works, this is not a material planning consideration in the assessment of the proposal. The Planning Author ity has a statutory responsibility to ensure the preservation and enhancement of listed buildings. Notwithstanding this, a proportionate balance does have to be struck between the r equirements of the Act and Development Plan policies and the practicality (and costs) of undertaking work on the historic fabric of a listed building. It is considered that the assessment of various options and the resultant justif ication to the preferred Option 4 is acceptable.

8.6 Matters to be secured by Section 75 Agreement

None

9. CONCLUSION

9.1 All relevant matters have been taken into account when appraising this application. It is considered that the proposal accords with the principles and policies contained within the Development Plan and is acce ptable in terms of all other applicable material considerations. The original proposal to reduce the height of the af fected chimney stack was unacceptable and could not be supported in terms of nation al guidance and policy. Following extensive discussions the proposal has ben amended and an acceptable solution found wher eby it is proposed to reconstruct the chimney stack to its or iginal height, but at 800mm thickness using original stones plus additional stonework. This will ensure the character and integrity of this listed building is retained.

10. **RECOMMENDATION**

Action required before decision issued	У	
Notification to Scottish Ministers	Ν	
Notification to Historic Scotland	у	14/03576/LBC
Conclusion of Section 75 Agreement	Ν	

Revocation of previous permission N

Subject to the above, it is recommended

- 14/03574/FUL GRANT planning permission, subject to conditions /notes to applicant
- 14/03576/LBC refer to Historic Scotland as the development is by the Council and involves a Ca tegory B Listed Building, with a recommendation to APPROVE, subject to suggested conditions / notes to applicant

14/03574/FUL

 The development shall be undert aken in accordance with the specification and details set out (Option 4 - engin eer's drawing no. 102545/ 002) in the Supporting Statement ('Highland Council Offices, Drummuie, Golspie -Unsafe East Chimney') dated 27.02.2015.

Reason: In order to protect the archit ectural and historic interest of the Category B Listed Building and s o as to clarify the terms of the permission granted.

LIMIT FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THIS PLANNING PERMISSION

In accordance with Section 58 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 (as amended), the dev elopment to which this planning permission relates must commence wit hin THREE YEARS of the date of this decision notice. If development has not commenced within this period, then this planning perm ission shall lapse.

Mud and Debris on Road

Please note that it an offence under Section 95 of the Roads (Scotland) Act 1984 to allow mud or any other material to be deposited, and thereafter remain, on a public road from any vehicle or development site. You must, ther efore, put in place a strategy for dealing with any material deposited on the public road network and maintain this until development is complete.

Local Roads Authority Consent

In addition to planning permission, you may require one or more separate consents (such as dropped kerb consent, a road openings permit, occupation of the road permit etc.) from TECS Roads prior to work comme ncing. Consent may als o be required for any works impacting upon the ro ad surface, the verge, drainage or any roadside footw ay or pavement.

These consents may require additional work and/or introduce additional specifications and you are therefore advised to contact your local TECS Roads office for further guidance at the earliest opportunity.

Failure to comply with access, parking and drainage infra structure requirements may endanger road users, affect the safety and free-flow of traffic and is likely to re sult in enforcement action being taken against you un der both the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 and the Roads (Scotland) Act 1984. Further information on the Council's roads standards can be found at: <u>http://www.highland.gov.uk/yourenvironment/roadsandtransport</u>

Application forms and guidance n otes for access-related consents can be downloaded from:

http://www.highland.gov.uk/yourenvironment/roadsandtransport/roads/Applicationformsforr oadoccupation.htm

Damage to the Public Road

Please note that the Council, under Section 96 of the Roads (Scotland) Act 1984, reserves the right to recover all costs for repairing any damage to the public road (and/or pavement) which can be attributed to construction works for this development.

Construction Hours and Noise-Generating Activities

You are advised that construction work associated with the approved development (incl. the loading/unloading of delivery vehicles, plant or other machinery), for which noise is audible at the boundary of the application site, should not normally tak e place outwith the hours of 08:00 and 19:00 Monday to Friday, 08:00 and 13:00 on Saturdays or at any time on a Sunday or Bank Holiday in Scotland, as prescribed in Schedule 1 of the Banking and Financial Dealings Act 1971 (as amended).

Work falling outwith these hours which gives rise to amenity concerns, or noise at any time which exceeds acceptable levels, may result in the service of a notice under Section 60 of the Control of Pollution Act 1974 (as amended). Breaching a Section 60 notice constitutes an offence and is likely to result in court action.

If you wish formal consent to work at specific times or on specific days, you may apply to the Council's Environmental Health Officer under Section 61 of the 1 974 Act. Any such application should be submitted after you have obtained your Building Warrant, if required, and will be considered on its merits. Any decision take n will reflect the nature of the development, the site's location and the proximity of noise sensit ive premises. Please contact <u>env.health@highland.gov.uk</u> for more information.

Initiation and Completion Notices

The Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 (as amended) requires all developers to submit notices to the Planning Authority prior to, and upon completion of, development. These are in addition to any other similar requirements (such as Building Warrant completion notices) and failure to comply represents a breach of planning control and may result in formal enforcement action.

- 1. The developer must submit a Notice of Initiatio n of Development in accordance with Section 27A of the Act to the Planning Authority prior t o work commencing on site.
- 2. On completion of the development, the developer must submit a Notice of Completion in accordance with Section 27B of the Act to the Planning Authority.

Copies of the notices referred to are attached to this decision notice for your convenience.

Accordance with Approved Plans and Conditions

You are advised that development must progress in accordance with the plans approved under, and any conditions attached to, this per mission. You must not deviate from this permission without consent from the Planning Authority (irrespective of any changes that may separately be req uested at the Building Warrant stage or by any other Statutory Authority). Any pre-conditions (those requiring certain works, submissions et c. prior to commencement of development) must be fulfilled prior to work starting on site. Failure to adhere to this permission and meet the requirements of all conditions may invalidate your permission or result in formal enforcement action.

Listed Buildings

Both planning permission and listed building consent are required for these works. You are not authorised to commence d evelopment until you have both consents in place. Furthermore, both consents and their respective conditions must be read, and complied with, in tandem.

14/03576/LBC

 The development shall be undert aken in accordance with the specification and details set out (Option 4 - engin eer's drawing no. 102545/ 002) in the Supporting Statement ('Highland Council Offices, Drummuie, Golspie -Unsafe East Chimney') dated 27.02.2015.

Reason: In order to protect the archit ectural and historic interest of the Category B Listed Building and s o as to clarify the terms of the permission granted.

TIME LIMIT FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THIS LISTED BUILDING CONSENT

In accordance with Section 16(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 (as amended), the works to which this listed building consent relates must commence within THREE YEARS of the date of this decision notice. If work has not commenced within this period, then this listed building consent shall lapse.

Listed Buildings

Both planning permission and listed building consent are required for these works. You are not authorised to commence d evelopment until you have both consents in place. Furthermore, both consents and their respective conditions must be read, and complied with, in tandem.

Signature:	Dafydd Jones
Designation:	Area Planning Manager North
Author:	Bob Robertson
Background Papers:	Documents referred to in report and in case file.
Relevant Plans:	

14/03574/FUL	14/03576/LBC
1 Location	1 Location
2 Photo	2 Photo
3 Option 4	3 Option 4



14/03574/FUL & 14/03576/LBC

Reduce the height of a chimney stack at Drummuie Area Office, The Highland Council, Golspie, KW10 6TA



Planning & Development Service

The Highland

Comhairle na

Gàidhealtachd

Council

Date: 14/05/2015



