The Highland Council

Planning, Development and Infrastructure Committee 4 November 2015

| Agenda Item | 11 |
|----------------|-------|
| Report | PDI |
| No | 66/15 |

Planning Appeals Update

Report by Director of Development and Infrastructure

Summary

This report provides Members with a summary of appeal decisions by the Directorate for Planning and Environmental Appeals from 1 April 2014 to 1 September 2015. It also provides an overview of decisions made by the Planning Review Body.

1. Introduction

1.1 This main purpose of this report is to advise the Planning, Development and Infrastructure Committee of the decisions on planning appeals issued by the Directorate of Planning and Environmental Appeals (DPEA) and the Scottish Ministers during the period 1 April 2014 to 1 September 2015. It also highlights decisions taken by the Planning Review Body during 2014/15.

2. Appeal Decisions

- 2.1 **Appendix 1** to this report provides a summary of the decisions made by the DPEA on appeals within the Highland Council area relating to planning applications and Section 75 Agreements, enforcement notices and High Hedge Notices. There were 33 such appeals (not including those appeals which were withdrawn or which the DPEA decided they had no remit).
- 2.2 Of the 26 cases where appeals were made against applications having been refused, 54% of appeals were dismissed. Of the remaining 12 (46%) where the appeals were allowed, only in 1 case were expenses awarded against the Council.
- 2.3 Two appeals were made against the Council's non determination of planning applications one of which was allowed (housing development in Drumnadrochit) and one of which was dismissed (Beinn Mhor wind farm). The Reporter's decision in this latter case is the subject of a statutory appeal to the Court of Session.
- 2.4 A number of appeals against enforcement notices have taken place during the period, reflecting the increased emphasis being placed on enforcement issues. The new arrangements for high hedges also resulted in one appeal against the terms of a high hedge notice served, which was dismissed.

3. Review Body Decisions

3.1 **Appendix 2** illustrates the performance of the Planning Review Body over the financial year period 2014/15, compared with performance across Scotland as a whole. The Council dealt with a total of 34 cases, and the original decision was upheld in 55.9% of cases, compared to a Scottish average of 64.3%.

4. Planning Appeal and Public Inquiry Costs

4.1 The costs of defending planning appeals and public inquiries related to Section 36/37 applications and any related legal challenges is reported to this Committee at regular intervals. The cost of these appeals, public inquiries and legal challenges over the financial year 2014/15 was approximately £117,000.

5. Implications

5.1 Resource

The costs associated with planning appeals are managed within the service budget.

5.2 <u>Equality, Legal, Climate Change/Carbon Clever, Risk, Rural and Gaelic</u>
There are no direct legal, equality, climate change/Carbon Clever, risk, rural or Gaelic implications directly arising from this report.

Recommendation

The Committee is recommended to note the outcomes of appeals as detailed in the report.

Designation: Director of Development and Infrastructure

Date: 20 October 2015

Author: Malcolm Macleod (Ext. 2506)

Appendix 1

| Appellant Site | | Officer Recommendation | Committee Decision | Appeal Decision | Expenses Claim |
|---|--|--|------------------------|---------------------|----------------------|
| Erection Of A Temporary (24 Months) 60M Anemometer Mast | Land 645M West Of Cloughmor, Farr, Near Inverness | Grant (14/04385/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Allowed | Expenses awarded |
| Land 265M NW Of Upper Northfield Farm, Hempriggs, Thrumster, Wick | Land 265M Nw Of Upper Northfield Farm, Hempriggs, Thrumster, Wick | Refusal of Application (14/03832/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Allowed | No award of expenses |
| Erection Of 3 Sheds (Retrospective) | 14 Fountain Square, Haster, Wick, KW1 5SX | Grant (14/04307/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Allowed | No award of expenses |
| Erection Of House, Formation Of Vehicular Access (Planning Permission In Principle) (Site 1) | Land East Of Lower Bayfield, Nigg, Tain, IV19 1QP | Refusal of Application (14/01944/PIP) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Dismissed | |
| Erection Of House, Formation Of Vehicular Access (Planning Permission In Principle) (Site 2) | Land 90M North West Of Redburn House, Nigg, Tain | Refusal of Application (14/01945/PIP) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Dismissed | |
| Erection Of House, Formation Of Vehicular Access (Planning Permission In Principle) (Site 3) | Land East Of Lower Bayfield, Nigg, Tain | Refusal of Application (14/01121/PIP) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Dismissed | |
| Modify The Planning Obligation Entered Into In Connection With The Grant Of Planning Permission For The Erection Of A House SW Of Westerlea, Croy (Ref. No. 10/00005/PIPIN) | Carrickholm, Cantray Cross Road, Croy, Inverness, IV2 5PN | Refusal of Application (14/04083/S75M) | n/a | Appeal Dismissed | |

| Discharge The Planning Obligation Entered Into In Connection With The Grant Of Planning Permission For The Erection Of A House | Holly Cottage, Muir Of Balnagowan, Ardersier, Inverness, IV2 7QX | Refusal of Application (14/03123/S75D) | n/a | Appeal Dismissed | |
|--|---|--|-----|--|---------------------|
| Erection Of 6 Turbines, Height 119.5M (Rated At Up To 3MW Each) & Associated Infrastructure | Beinn Mhor Wind Farm, Guisachan, Tomich, Cannich, Beauly | Failure to give a decision (14/01731/FUL) | n/a | Appeal Dismissed (Decision appealed to Court of Session) | |
| Alleged Unauthorised Building Of Extension Not In Accordance With Condition 1, Or Approved Plans, Of Planning Permission 07/00695/FULIN (Section 123(1)(B) Of The Act) | Clisham, 71 Culduthel Road, Inverness, IV2 4HH | Enforcement Notice (14/00369/ENF) | n/a | Appeal Dismissed | |
| Alleged Unauthorised Failure To Comply With Conditions No. 1 And No.3 Of Planning Permission 14/02059/FUL Granted On 11 August 2014 | Land Adjacent To Keeper's Cottage, Strathsteven, Brora, KW9 6NL | Enforcement Notice (14/00333/ENF) | n/a | Appeal Allowed | No expenses awarded |
| Unauthorised Installation Of 3 No External Steel Roller Shutters (And Associated Fixtures And Fittings) Over Window Openings On Front Elevation Of The Church Hall | The Church Hall, Crescent Road, Nairn, IV12 4NE | Enforcement Notice (14/00034/ENF) | n/a | Appeal Dismissed | |
| Certificate Of Lawfulness Proposed Development (Construction Of House) | Plot 1 , Land 50M Se Of Culbo Mains Farm, Culbokie, Dingwall | Refusal of Application (14/02535/CLE) | n/a | Appeal Allowed | No expenses awarded |

| Certificate Of Lawfulness Of Proposed Development (Construction Of House) | Plot 2, Land 50M Se Of Culbo Mains Farm, Culbokie, Dingwall | Refusal of Application (14/02536/CLE) | n/a | Appeal Allowed | No expenses awarded |
|---|---|---|------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------|
| Alleged Unauthorised Importation & Deposit Of Inert Waste Materials And Subsequent Engineering Operations To Form A Shoreline Bund; The Creation Of An Embankment And Raising Of Ground Levels; And The Culverting Of The Watercourse Near The Shoreline | Friars Croft, Milton Of Culloden, Inverness | Enforcement Notice (13/00099/ENF) | n/a | Appeal Allowed in Part | No expenses awarded |
| Change Of Use Of Open Amenity Ground To House Curtilage | 59B Strathspey Drive, Grantown-On-Spey, PH26 3EY | Grant (14/03015/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Allowed | No expenses awarded |
| Wind Farm Comprising 7 Wind Turbines With A Maximum Tip Height Of 100M, And With An Installed Generating Capacity Of Up To 21 Megawatts. Associated Infrastructure Includes Wind Turbine Transformers, A Meteorological Mast, New And Upgraded Access Tracks, Control Building And Substation, Underground Cables, And A Temporary Construction Compound. | Land 1300M East Of Spittal Hill, Spittal, Caithness | Refusal of Application (13/04559/FUL) | n/a | Appeal Dismissed | |
| One 50Kw Wind Turbine, Height To Hub 24.6M, Height To Tip 34.2M, Blade Diameter 19.2M And Siting Of Equipment Cabin (Resubmission Of 12/02302/FUL) | Rootfield Farm, Muir Of Ord, IV6 7RF | Grant (13/00284/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Dismissed | |

| Wind Farm (Max. 50Mw Installed Capacity) Comprising 20 Turbines (110M Max. High To Blade Tip) And Associated Infrastructure, Access Tracks And 3 Borrow Pits (Glen Kyllachy Wind Farm) | Land 6000M West Of Findhorn Bridge, At Glen Kyllachy, Tomatin | Grant (13/02441/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Allowed | No expenses awarded |
|--|--|---|------------------------|--|---------------------|
| Application Under Section 42 To Develop Land Without Compliance With Condition 5 Previously Attached To Planning Permission Ref: 11/04228/FUL Nb For The Operation Of A Marine Fish Farm (Atlantic Salmon) | Site North West Of Sgeir Dughall Loch Torridon, Diabaig, Torridon | Refusal of Application (14/01868/S42) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Dismissed (Decision appealed to Court of Session) | |
| Appeal Against High Hedge Notice By Hedge Neighbour Disputing The Height The Hedge Is To Be Reduced To (Notice Requires Hedge To Be Reduced To 4 Metres In Height) | 9 Charleston Place, Inverness, IV3 8NB | High Hedge Notice (14/00001/HH) | n/a | High Hedge decision confirmed | |
| Change Of Use To Waste Transfer Station (Capacity 24,999 Tonnes) | 38 Carsegate Road North, Inverness | Grant (14/02502/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Allowed | No expenses awarded |
| Erection Of Temporary 80 Metre High Meteorological Mast And Associated Fencing. | Land At Farley Estate, By Kilmorack, Beauly | Grant (14/00644/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Allowed | No expenses awarded |
| Lochend Wind Farm. Erection Of 4 No. 2300Kw Wind Turbines With A Height To Tip Of 99.5M, Height Hub Of 64M, Rotor Diameter Of 71M And Associated Works | Land 978 M SE Of Lochend Holding, Barrock, Caithness | Refusal of Application (13/02682/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Allowed | No expenses awarded |

| Revised Layout And Design - Demolition Of Rose Street Hall & Decked Car Park & Phased Redevelopment To Provide Multi-Storey Student Accommodation, Shops, Food & Drink Premises, Public Space & Environmental Enhancement | South And West Of Rose Street, Inverness | Grant (13/04137/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Dismissed | |
|--|--|---|------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
| Construction And Operation Of A 15 Turbine (2 To 3 Mw Output, 14 No. Up To 121M Tip Height And 1 No. Up To 110M Tip Height) Wind Farm, Crane Hardstandings, Site Access And Tracks, Single Substation Compound, Control Building, Three Borrow Pits, Felling Of Up To Approximately 1Ha Of Trees, Two Temporary Compounds And Associated Parking | Balnacoil Lodge, Brora, KW9 6LX | Refusal of Application (13/03312/FUL) | n/a | Appeal Dismissed | |
| Mixed Use Development Comprising, Housing, Affordable Housing, Homes For The Elderly, Mixed Commercial Uses, Health Centre, Public Open Space And Associated Infrastructure | Land 145M North Of Smiddy Bar, Lewiston, Drumnadrochit | Failure to give a decision (13/03694/PIP) | | Appeal Allowed | Expenses awarded |
| Replace Windows On Front And Rear Elevation With Double Glazed Sash And Case Lookalike Windows | 7 Campbell Street, Thurso, KW14 7HA | Refusal of Application (12/04062/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Dismissed | |
| Construction And Operation Of Wind Farm (Tressady) Consisting Of Thirteen Wind Turbines And Associated Works | Land 1600M West Of Craggiemore, Tressady Estate, Rogart | Grant (13/02749/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Dismissed | |

| Erection Of House (Resubmission Of Application 13/00812/FUL) | Land South Of 17 Marine Park, North Kessock | Grant (13/03989/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Allowed | No expenses awarded |
|--|---|---|------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
| Construction Of A Windfarm Comprising 10No. Wind Turbines With A Tip Height Of Up To 99.5M, Crane Hard-Standings, Access Tracks, 64M Anemometry Mast; Control Building, Buried Cables, Construction Compound And 2 Temporary Borrow Pits | Lyth Wind Farm, Near Lyth, Wick | Refusal of Application (13/01832/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Dismissed | |
| Wind Farm Comprising 13 Wind Turbines (2.5Kw), Crane Hardstandings, External Transformers, Access Bell Mouth From The A9, Access Tracks, 60M Anemometry Mast, Control Building And Substation Compound | Bad A Cheo Wind Farm, Achkeepster, Spittal, Caithness | Grant (12/02868/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Allowed | No expenses awarded |
| Residential Development Of 319 Units And Associated Infrastructure And Public Open Space | Land At Cawdor Road, Nairn | Grant (11/04355/FUL) | Refusal of Application | Appeal Dismissed | Expenses awarded |

Local Review Bodies (LRBs)¹

| | 2014/15 | | | | 2013/14 | | | 2012/13 | | |
|--------------------------------|--------------|--------------|------------|--------------|--------------|------------|--------------|--------------|------------|--|
| | Number of | Overall | % Original | Number of | Overall | % Original | Number of | Overall | % Original | |
| | Number of | Average Time | decision | Number of | Average Time | decision | Number of | Average Time | decision | |
| Planning Authority | applications | (weeks) | upheld | applications | (weeks) | upheld | applications | (weeks) | upheld | |
| Aberdeen City | 25 | 5.8 | 72.0% | 2 | 31.0 | 50.0% | 3 | 5.0 | 33.3% | |
| Aberdeenshire | 60 | 19.5 | 76.7% | 47 | 26.1 | 78.7% | 49 | 26.9 | 71.4% | |
| Angus | 15 | 11.3 | 80.0% | 20 | 7.7 | 85.0% | 18 | 7.8 | 83.3% | |
| Argyll & Bute | 12 | 30.4 | 91.7% | 14 | 16.3 | 64.3% | 20 | 11.0 | 70.0% | |
| Cairngorms NP ¹ | 0 | - | - | 0 | - | - | n/a | n/a | n/a | |
| Clackmannanshire | 1 | 27.9 | 0.0% | 1 | 15.9 | 100.0% | 3 | 12.6 | 0.0% | |
| Dumfries & Galloway | 12 | 14.3 | 83.3% | 21 | 14.2 | 76.2% | 17 | 16.0 | 88.2% | |
| Dundee City | 7 | 16.2 | 100.0% | 4 | 17.1 | 25.0% | 9 | 15.9 | 66.7% | |
| East Ayrshire | 11 | 13.5 | 90.9% | 21 | 14.6 | 66.7% | 21 | 9.1 | 61.9% | |
| East Dunbartonshire | 9 | 11.0 | 66.7% | 7 | 11.7 | 57.1% | 10 | 13.6 | 40.0% | |
| East Lothian | 7 | 11.0 | 57.1% | 12 | 12.6 | 58.3% | 10 | 9.7 | 50.0% | |
| East Renfrewshire | 8 | 8.8 | 75.0% | 6 | 7.4 | 50.0% | 12 | 8.6 | 66.7% | |
| City of Edinburgh | 77 | 7.1 | 51.9% | 75 | 6.4 | 62.7% | 71 | 7.7 | 52.1% | |
| Eilean Siar | 3 | 11.6 | 0.0% | 1 | 5.4 | 0.0% | 1 | 9.3 | 0.0% | |
| Falkirk | 8 | 25.2 | 37.5% | 3 | 17.6 | 33.3% | 1 | 15.9 | 100.0% | |
| Fife | 47 | 16.9 | 63.8% | 51 | 16.4 | 47.1% | 42 | 16.3 | 47.6% | |
| Glasgow City | 35 | 8.9 | 68.6% | 20 | 8.7 | 72.5% | 26 | 9.7 | 42.3% | |
| Highland | 34 | 16.3 | 55.9% | 28 | 14.8 | 35.7% | 21 | 10.0 | 42.9% | |
| Inverclyde | 8 | 13.6 | 50.0% | 9 | 13.7 | 44.4% | 6 | 19.4 | 83.3% | |
| Loch Lomond & The Trossachs NP | 4 | 14.1 | 25.0% | 0 | - | - | 1 | 16.1 | 100.0% | |
| Midlothian | 16 | 10.4 | 25.0% | 16 | 11.7 | 31.3% | 14 | 11.1 | 35.7% | |
| Moray | 14 | 11.0 | 78.6% | 22 | 7.0 | 50.0% | 28 | 8.6 | 42.9% | |
| North Ayrshire | 8 | 5.6 | 62.5% | 9 | 7.0 | 77.8% | 14 | 9.9 | 64.3% | |
| North Lanarkshire | 5 | 6.0 | 80.0% | 2 | 7.1 | 0.0% | 1 | 2.7 | 100.0% | |
| Orkney Islands | 3 | 11.3 | 66.7% | 4 | 15.5 | 75.0% | 7 | 15.4 | 28.6% | |
| Perth & Kinross | 42 | 18.5 | 69.0% | 56 | 16.2 | 51.8% | 60 | 15.4 | 70.0% | |
| Renfrewshire | 3 | 13.1 | 100.0% | 3 | 10.9 | 66.7% | 8 | 9.7 | 100.0% | |
| Scottish Borders | 27 | 7.1 | 63.0% | 39 | 8.1 | 48.7% | 19 | 8.4 | 73.7% | |
| Shetland Islands | 6 | 19.2 | 33.3% | 0 | - | - | 2 | 15.4 | 0.0% | |
| South Ayrshire | 19 | 11.1 | 52.6% | 22 | 10.2 | 72.7% | 23 | 8.0 | 74.0% | |
| South Lanarkshire | 7 | 8.5 | 85.7% | 4 | 10.2 | 100.0% | 1 | 10.7 | 0.0% | |
| Stirling | 5 | 18.6 | 60.0% | 7 | 10.4 | 85.7% | 7 | 16.4 | 28.6% | |
| West Dunbartonshire | 1 | 12.0 | 0.0% | 1 | 5.0 | 0.0% | 0 | - | - | |
| West Lothian | 15 | 7.0 | 60.0% | 16 | 8.8 | 75.0% | 12 | 6.7 | 50.0% | |
| SCOTLAND ^{2,3} | 554 | 13.0 | 64.3% | 543 | 12.8 | 59.8% | 537 | 12.6 | 59.2% | |

^{1.} The Cairngorms National Park Authority (CNPA) do not receive planning applications directly but are notified of applications which have been made to those planning authorities within the park boundaries. The CNPA may then decide to call applications in for their determination. Planning applications may therefore have already been in the system for a number of weeks before being transferred to the CNPA. The percentage of Cairngorms applications processed in under 2 and 4 months are lower than those of the other planning authorities due to the reasons stated above. The CPNA do not have delegation powers.

For further explanation please see Cairngorms Statement.